



**San Francisco Police Department  
Professional Standards & Principled Policing Bureau  
Department of Justice Compliance**

<b>Individual Recommendation Status Report</b> Bureau: Field Operations Rec. Number: 33.1 Assigned To Project Manager: James Shields Prepared by: James Shields Priority: Low	<b>Reserved For Executive Sponsor Only</b> Date Issued: November 7, 2016 Return Date: Success level: Choose One Other Status: Noncompliance: Waiver approval:
---	---

Notes:

**DOJ Objective: Bias**

**DOJ Recommendation #: 33.1**

The SFPD should implement the data collection recommendations in appendix F to allow for better information and analysis of stop data.

**Purpose:**

To ensure the collection of stops data allow for a robust analysis of possible bias by SFPD officers.

This recommendation was based by the finding of: "The current E-585 traffic stop incident report does not collect sufficient or appropriate information to allow for a robust analysis of possible bias by SFPD officers."

On January 3, 2017 the collection of stop data, based on California Assembly Bill AB-953 as well as local San Francisco Ordinance 166-15, was fully implemented for the San Francisco Police Department. It replaced E585.

Called eStop, the stop data for every person detained – whether it be Traffic or non-Traffic – are entered into a mobile application that is saved to the Crime Data Warehouse (CDW). Every field value selected of the stop data collected by the officer is eligible for detailed reporting as well as for roll-up in aggregate/summary reporting from CDW. It provides considerably more information than the previous E585 which was cited in the finding for DOJ Recommendation 33.1.



**San Francisco Police Department  
Professional Standards & Principled Policing Bureau  
Department of Justice Compliance**

**Policy:**

Per Department Bulletin 16-208, "All members shall receive training before being required to enter data into eStop. Once a member has been trained, the member shall enter all stops into the eStop database and discontinue to use the E585 mask." This Department Bulletin supersedes DB 16-168 which mandated E585 entries on all Traffic stops for motor vehicles, bicycles and pedestrians. With the implementation of eStop data collection, stops were expanded to include both Traffic and non-Traffic. Additionally, eStop expanded the criteria for stops to include – ***but not limited to*** – pedestrian, bicycle and vehicle stops as stated in the November 2016 DB16-208.



**San Francisco Police Department  
Professional Standards & Principled Policing Bureau  
Department of Justice Compliance**

---

**Written Directive: (D.G.O., Dept. Manual, Bureau Orders, Dept. Bulletins, etc.)**

Department Bulletin, Class A, 16-208 was issued on November 28, 2016. It states, among other things:

**"The new eStop program will expand the criteria to include *all* stops, including but not limited to pedestrian, bicycle and vehicle stops."**



DB 16-208 eStop

The above Department Bulletin superseded DB 16-168 dated October 17, 2016. In this superseded Bulletin it makes reference to the upcoming eStop program.



DB 16-168 E585

Cable Teletype broadcasted: The effective date of January 3, 2017 for eStop replaces E585:



eStop Teletype

Training Bulletin signed-off by the SFPD Deputy Chief of the Admin Bureau and SFPD CIO for the eStop Pilot program which preceded the eStop roll-out in December 2016.



Training Bulletin  
eStop Pilot Program



**San Francisco Police Department  
Professional Standards & Principled Policing Bureau  
Department of Justice Compliance**

**Supporting Documentation: (Learning Domains, Power points, Lesson Plans, Policies)**

Below is an outline on how the supporting documentation will be presented for this section of *Supporting Documentation: (Learning Domains, Power points, Lesson Plans, Policies)*. Following this outline will be the documentation in the order of this outline.

**DEVELOPMENT:**

- Requirements
- Design
- Testing
- Issues Log
- Change Log

**MEETINGS:**

- eStop Meeting through post Go-Live

**NOTE:** Some documentation may have eCitation combined with eStop. This is because in the initial stages of development, both eCitation and eStop were discussed due to shared data collection points between the two applications.

**DEVELOPMENT:**

- Requirements



CA Legislation  
AB-953

- - California Legislation Assembly Bill: AB-953 which mandates state and local agencies that employ peace officers to annually report to the Attorney General on all stops.



SF BOS 0166-15

- - San Francisco Local Ordinance 166-15 which mandates quarterly reporting of encounters to the Board of Supervisors (see Sections 96.A.1, 2, 3).



eCitation / eStop  
Reqmts

- - Requirements/specifications documented for development in conjunction with eCitation. See Section 4.1.1.12.



**San Francisco Police Department  
Professional Standards & Principled Policing Bureau  
Department of Justice Compliance**



RIPA\_2006-07-08

- - Racial and Identity Profiling Advisory (RIPA) Board presentation from July 8, 2016. Note that the Stop Data Regulations (re: slide 14), of January 1, 2017 was postponed..



eStop Work Plan\_v1

- - Work Plan starting from September 2016. Also included is a Go-Live Peg List.



eStop Timeline from  
2016-08-16

- - High-level timeline on implementing eStop as seen in August 2016.



eStop

- Items-Requirements - Includes issues, requirements and design that have been resolved as well as items for the future.



eStop-AB953

- - Presents all required fields of the eStop application with its list of values. Additionally, each of the fields cites the specific area of the legislation (AB-953 or BOS 166-15) – in row 2. Also note that the text of the cited legislation can be seen via *Excel's comments* (in the northeast corner of each cell in row 2).
- Cellular improvements in the City of San Francisco made by AT&T:
  - AT&T has prepared a map of the city of its 2016 cellular improvements for SFPD. This document is *confidential* and is *not to be shared* with vendors nor with members of the private sectors, nor the public. It is available upon request. The cellular improvements made were in preparation for rolling out the eStop application on the Department-issued Android phones. Of the 89 improvements completed by AT&T, 3 were major.



**San Francisco Police Department  
Professional Standards & Principled Policing Bureau  
Department of Justice Compliance**

• Design



eCitation / eStop  
Design

- - Design document based on requirements. See sections 10.3 and Appendix 13.



Design Decision -  
Race/Ethnicity.docx

- - Presents the decision-making process in reaching the final list of Race and Ethnicity values that eStop data will collect in order to be used to track and report stop encounters per California Assembly Bill 953 and SF Board of Supervisors Ordinance 166-15.



Design Decision -  
Android access path

- - Presents the decision-making process in reaching the decision that the access path to the eStop application on the Android phone will be through the SFPD Mobile wrapper.



Design Decision -  
Accessing on Desktop

- - Presents the decision-making process on how eStop will be accessed via the SFPD Desktop Computer.

• Testing



VPN connection  
lost - Testing

- - Instructions on testing for VPN connection lost when both eStop (VPN) and Axon View (Wi-Fi) are both being used on the Android phone.



Android OS 6.0.1  
test results

- - Results from testing VPN connection lost with Android OS 6.0.1.



Android OS 5.1.1  
test results

- - Results from testing VPN connection lost with Android OS 5.1.1.



**San Francisco Police Department  
Professional Standards & Principled Policing Bureau  
Department of Justice Compliance**

- Issues Log



Issues Log\_eStop

- - Presents a detailed account (chronologically) for each issue from when the issue was identified to resolution.

- Change Log



eStopChangeLog\_2  
017-02-02

- - Presents a log of eStop changes to the Development, Test, and Production instances.

**MEETINGS:**

- eStop Meetings through post Go-Live



2016, 2017 eStop  
Meetings

- - Includes over 25 meeting minutes as well as its agendas.



San Francisco Police Department  
Professional Standards & Principled Policing Bureau  
Department of Justice Compliance

Implementation, training & records (How to prove we did what we said?)

Below is an outline on how the supporting documentation will be presented for this section of *Implementation, training & records (How to prove we did what we said?)*. Following this outline will be the documentation in the order of this outline.

PILOT FOR SOUTHERN STATION:

- Training
- Feedback
- Evaluation
- Status Communication
- Audit

ROLL-OUT FOR JANUARY 3, 2017 GO-LIVE:

- Training
- Status Communication
- Reporting & Appendix F
- Audit

PILOT FOR SOUTHERN STATION:

- Training



eStop Training  
Manual for Pilot

- - PowerPoint used for member training of piloting eStop.



eStop Sign In

- - Sign-in sheet that was used for members who were being trained. Afterwards, the names on the each sign-in sheet would be entered into HRMS which serves as the official record on who was trained for eStop.

- Feedback



eStop Survey  
Monkey

- - Survey Monkey sent out to 75 trained members at the Southern Station.



Raw Feedback -  
eStop Pilot

- - Raw feedback of the 20 responses received.





**San Francisco Police Department  
Professional Standards & Principled Policing Bureau  
Department of Justice Compliance**



- eStop Metrics on Feedback - Pilot - Metrics summarizing the above raw feedback of 20 responses from the Pilot.

• Evaluation



- Exit Criteria for eStop Go-Live - Exit criteria from the Pilot that was met in order to move forward with the Roll-out of eStop.

• Status Communication



- Communication on end-of-Pilot - E-mail from eStop Project Manager to Captain Daryl Fong (Southern Station Captain) on the conclusion of the eStop Pilot and the start of the Roll-out for Go-Live.

• Audit



- eStop Entries - Southern Pilot - Graph on the number of daily eStop entries during Pilot at Southern Station.



- eStop Pilot Training - Members trained at the Southern Station for Pilot.



**San Francisco Police Department  
Professional Standards & Principled Policing Bureau  
Department of Justice Compliance**

**ROLL-OUT FOR JANUARY 3, 2017 GO-LIVE:**



eStop Roll-out Plan

- - The eStop Roll-out Plan was based on exiting a 5-week Pilot near the end of November 2016. Train-the-Trainers would take place the last week of November 2016 and immediately follow with member training at each of the locations in December 2016. As members were trained, they would discontinue the use of E585. The original date of January 1, 2017 for Go-Live was moved to January 3<sup>rd</sup> (2 days later) to ensure there was adequate Tech Support should any problem arise. This Go-Live date of January 3, 2017 meant that E585 would no longer be accessible and that all stops data would be performed via eStop.

- Training



eStop Training for  
Roll-out of Go-Live

- - Training manual for eStop used in all training sessions: Both Train-the-Trainer and member training.



eStop Sign In

- - (Same as the one used for Pilot training.) Sign-in sheet that was used for members who were being trained. Afterwards, the names on the each sign-in sheet would be entered into HRMS which serves as the official record on who was trained for eStop.



eStop

- Train-the-Trainers - A tracker on members who were trained as Train-the-Trainers from 11/3/2016 – 12/15/2016. A by-unit summarization is also included in the spreadsheet.

- Status Communication



eStop Roll-out  
e-mail

- - E-mail to Command Staff on the upcoming training for Train-the-Trainers for eStop.



eStop

- Train-the-Trainer sta - Interim status to Command Staff on Train-the-Trainer status. The e-mail thread provides a history of updates from November 29 – December 12, 2016. Train-the-Trainer sessions began on November 28.



**San Francisco Police Department  
Professional Standards & Principled Policing Bureau  
Department of Justice Compliance**

- Reporting & APPENDIX F



Stops January 2017

- - DRAFT - DRAFT on eStop metrics from officers' stops data collection in the month of January 2017.
  - The above draft includes metrics on Stops by:
    - Reason
    - Race
    - Hispanic and non-Hispanic
    - Ethnicity
    - Sex
    - District
    - Type of Search
    - Category
    - Contact Type
    - Result of Contact



Appendix F - DOJ  
Coll. Reform Init.

- - Appendix F of the DOJ Collaborative Reform Initiative, October 2016 is an assessment by the DOJ on California Legislation AB-953 for collecting stop data with the purpose of making recommendations that will allow 'for a robust analysis of possible bias by SFPD officers'. These recommendations cover both traffic and pedestrian stop data.

Identifying bias from stop data would likely be first identified by looking at records aggregated or summarized – that is, a number of records for a given period of time based on a limited selected number of fields.



## San Francisco Police Department Professional Standards & Principled Policing Bureau Department of Justice Compliance

Specifically, there are over 20 eStop data fields for a variety of slice-and-dice analyses as well as drilling down to view specific individual records, as necessary:

- CAD# (allows linkage into Incident Reports and Duration of Stop)
  - →Appendix F, pages 344, 345
- District of the officer
  - Useful in comparing the same data across different officers.
- Contact Date
  - →Appendix F, pages 343, 350
- Contact Time
  - →Appendix F, pages 343, 350
- Race
  - →Appendix F, pages 343, 345, 348, 350, 354
- Ethnicity
  - →Appendix F, pages 343, 345, 348, 350, 354
- Age
  - →Appendix F, pages 343, 345, 348, 350, 353
- Sex
  - →Appendix F, pages 343, 345, 348, 350, 353
- Stop Category (Dispatch or Self-Initiated)
  - Useful in comparing the same data based on Dispatch vs. Self-Initiated across multiple officers using the same assigned location.
- Reason for Stop
  - →Appendix F, pages 343, 344, 350
- Search
  - →Appendix F, pages 343, 344, 350
- Result of Search
  - →Appendix F, pages 343, 344, 350
- Result of Stop
  - →Appendix F, page 343, 350
- Contact Type (Pedestrian, Bicyclist, Motor Vehicle, etc.)
  - →Appendix F, page 345, 350
- Address of the detention (includes Street, City, State, ZIP)
  - →Appendix F, page 343, 350
- Officer Assignment (Plainclothes, Uniformed)
- Officer Vehicle
- Officers at Scene (useful for inquiries and investigations)
- Officer creating the stop data
  - Capturing this in the stop data record allows a link to the officer's HRMS data, such as age, race, gender, length of service and rank of the officer.
    - →Appendix F, pages 349 & 355

The intent of the AB-953 legislation is to identify racial and identity profiling so that the appropriate action can be taken to prevent further occurrence.



**San Francisco Police Department  
Professional Standards & Principled Policing Bureau  
Department of Justice Compliance**

Given the timeframe to implement the collection of stop data (by January 1, 2017), eStop was developed according to the requirements outlined in AB-953 which is primarily focused on the 4 areas of when a person is detained by the officer:

- When and where.
- Reason.
- Result of both stop and search.
- Race, ethnicity, gender, age.

It is important to note that not all officer stops result in issuing a Citation or making an arrest.

For a more detailed view of the stop that is associated with person's demeanor (Appendix F, pages 349, 354) and specifics related to a Citation (Appendix F, page 349), both an Incident Report and NOTICE TO APPEAR Citation are available to provide additional insight and analysis.



San Francisco Police Department  
Professional Standards & Principled Policing Bureau  
Department of Justice Compliance

- Audit



- Dec 2016 eStop entries - PROD - Graphs on the number of daily eStop entries during member training in December 2016.



- eStop Audit Report - Trained Members - Audit report on all sworn members, showing the dates of eStop training based on signatures from the eStop sign-in sheet. Training completion for eStop includes both Train-the-Trainers (Course SF230T) and member training (Course SF230).



- eStop Audit\_2017-02-09 - Report on members who have not made an eStop entry as of February 9, 2017. Report includes all members regardless of assignment, whether it be District Station, the Academy, on medical or administrative duties, etc.



- 2017-02-17 Audit E-mails - E-mails sent to Captains of 10 District Stations and the Traffic Co. on assigned members who have not written an eStop as of 2/9/2017. Note that members in each of the lists include those who could be on medical, administrative duties, etc.



- E585 entries 2016 vs 2017 - The purpose of comparing Traffic stops in 2016 (based on Level II E585 + Crossroads E585) with eStop Traffic stops in 2017 is to validate that there is not a notable or significant difference methods of collecting Traffic stops data. That is, that eStop Traffic stops is within the average range of the system that was replaced – E585. Since there was no previous data collection for *non-Traffic* stops, no comparison was possible.