


From: Tanya Koshy [REDACTED]

Sent: Thursday, May 28, 2020 1:18:37 PM

Subject: Cal DOJ's review of Recommendation 94.2

 This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

Dear Captain Bailey,

Our office has completed its review of the materials supporting implementation of Recommendation 94.2 that have been submitted to us as part of the collaborative reform process. After reviewing the package and information provided by the Department, the California Department of Justice finds as follows:

Recommendation 94.2: The SFPD should prioritize the personnel and human resource data to better inform and support management decisions and practices.

Response to Recommendation 94.2:

The SFPD's Staffing and Deployment Unit (SDU) identified several key categories of data it would need to inform management decisions related to personnel needs, including race and gender demographic data, vacancy data, and separation data. SDU has identified several priorities regarding data collection, including monitoring demographic trends, identifying vacancies, and tracking the position history of an employee. As one example of the SDU's effort to prioritize certain data collection needs, the SDU developed a Position Control Number (PCN) system, which assigns a unique identifier (PCN) to each position. By assigning a PCN to each position, the SDU can then keep track of the particular employees who held that position and their associated demographic data.

The SDU holds biweekly meetings with command staff where it provides reports on personnel and human resources data, which command staff can use to inform staffing decisions. The command staff uses these meetings to make additional data analysis requests of the SDU. Further, the SDU also meets with the Administration Bureau, the Staff Services Division, and the City's Department of Human Resources on a quarterly basis to discuss demographic data and strategies to address demographic disparities. Finally, the SDU meets weekly to discuss data findings, needs, and to monitor progress on data analysis requests.

Based upon all of the above, the Department of Justice finds that SFPD is in substantial compliance with this recommendation. Please let us know if you have any questions or would like to discuss these further. Thank you.

Tanya



Collaborative Reform Completion Memorandum

Finding # 94: The SFPD does not maintain, analyze, or use data to support and forecast human resource needs, including diversity staffing, succession, or basic demographics. The SFPD cannot readily identify basic demographic data on its employees or readily access training records, separation records, and other human resource data for analysis and development in the department.

Recommendation # 94.2 The SFPD should prioritize the personnel and human resource data to better inform and support management decisions and practices.

Response Date: 5/19/2020

Executive Summary:

The San Francisco Police Department (SFPD) formed the Staffing and Deployment Unit in April 2018 to be a centralized and impartial unit that conducts all staffing-related projects. The purpose of the Staffing and Deployment Unit is to collect, maintain and analyze all Department staffing data, hence benefitting SFPD by monitoring and analyzing the deployment of all personnel (sworn and non-sworn) across the entire Department.

Since its inception, the Staffing and Deployment Unit has undertaken specific initiatives to track and maintain personnel and human resource data to better inform and support executive-level management decisions and practices. The Staffing and Deployment Unit is critical in maintaining personnel and human resource data and realizing staffing decisions in order for the Department to fulfill its mission of "Safety with Respect" in an efficient manner consistent with the evolving priorities and expectations of the Chief of Police and the stakeholders of the City.

Compliance Measures:

1) Identify key personnel and administrative data, consistent with Rec. 94.1.

The Staffing and Deployment Unit is comprised of the key personnel responsible for the prioritization of personnel and human resource data in order to better inform and support management decisions and practices. The Department has dedicated significant full time resources to accomplish this priority which currently includes one sworn lieutenant, two sworn sergeants, one sworn officer, and one civilian senior personnel analyst. Through its focus on providing information to decision makers and emphasis on data driven staffing, the Staffing and Deployment Unit has worked with SFPD Human Resources, the Department's executive level Command Staff, outside consultants/contractors, and other city agencies such as the Office of



Collaborative Reform Completion Memorandum

the Controller to identify the department's data needs for personnel and human resource analysis, and to implement projects to facilitate the collection and analysis of this data.

The Staffing and Deployment Unit determined the following key personnel data needs to support staffing, resource planning, and to support management decisions and practices:

- Demographic Data (including both race and sex)
- Language Skill Data
- Tenure Data (age and length of service)
- Vacancy Data (vacant positions within each rank)
- Assignment Data (related to both individual members as well as specific positions)
- Full Duty Status Data
- Separation Data
- Training Records Data
- Workload Based Staffing Data

As mentioned in Recommendation 94.1, all of these aforementioned datasets are currently being collected on an ongoing basis. This data is analyzed regularly and utilized as the basis for decision-making by the Staffing and Deployment Unit and Command Staff.

The aforementioned data needs were established by the Staffing and Deployment Unit in order to support organizational diversity, succession planning, forecasting, and the enablement of barrier analyses for Department employees in all ranks and assignments.

The identification and collection of personnel and human resource data and the delegation of this identification and collection to the Staffing and Deployment Unit supports the prioritization of this data to better inform and support management decisions and practices. The reports and analysis generated by the Staffing and Deployment Unit makes employee data and human resource data readily identifiable to support command staff management decisions and practices. In addition, this data is readily assessable to internal and external stakeholders.

Supporting Documents:

- ✓ Department Bulletin 18-073 – Staffing and Deployment (Attachment 1)
- ✓ PowerPoint: Overview of Staffing and Deployment Unit, presented to newly promoted Lieutenants and Captains on November 7, 2018 (Attachment 2)
- ✓ Staff Services Unit Order 19-01 (Attachment 3)
- ✓ Department Statistics Report – 8/21/19 (Attachment 4)
- ✓ Gender Breakdown by Year (Attachment 5)
- ✓ Race Breakdown by Year (Attachment 6)
- ✓ Race and Gender Dashboard (Attachment 7)
- ✓ Promotion to Sergeant, Lieutenant, Captain, Commander, Deputy Chief, Assistant Chief, and Chief 2010-2019 by Race and Gender (Attachment 8)
- ✓ Language Proficiency Report – 8/21/19 (Attachment 9)
- ✓ Probation to Permanent Transfer Spreadsheet – Recruit Class 256 – 1/25/19 (Attachment 10)



Collaborative Reform Completion Memorandum

- ✓ POI Report – 8/12/19 (Attachment 11)
- ✓ Department Summary of Years of Service – January 2019 (Attachment 12)
- ✓ Succession Planning: Age and Years of Service (Attachment 27)
- ✓ Vacant Position Report – 8/21/19 (Attachment 13)
- ✓ Police Positions – Budget Snapshot (April 26, 2019 / PO #8) (Attachment 14)
- ✓ Central Station Seniority Report – 8/21/19 (Attachment 15)
- ✓ Sworn Personnel by Bureau and Department ID (Attachment 28)
- ✓ SFPD Citywide Current Sworn Staffing – 5/6/19 (Attachment 16)
- ✓ Full Duty and Not Full Duty Trend Analysis and Trend Analysis: Full Duty Q2s in Patrol (All District Stations) (Attachment 29)
- ✓ Police Terminations by Category – 8/21/19 (Attachment 17)
- ✓ Non-Training, Non-Service Separations: Overview, Non-Training or Service Separations: Drilldown, and Non-Training or Service Separations: Who?) (Attachment 30)
- ✓ Separation Questionnaire for Academy Recruits (Attachment 18)
- ✓ Screen Capture of Business Intelligence Training Analytics Module (Attachment 19)
- ✓ Position Control Number Overview (Attachment 20)

2) Establish data priorities.

Pursuant to this RFI, in 2019 Hillard Heintze determined SFPD completed compliance measure 2 as part of the department's initial response. Internal human resource data collection, maintenance and analysis (as mentioned above as well as outlined comprehensively in Recommendation 94.1) as well as external partnerships will be used for the following activities:

- **Monitoring demographic trends** – Race and gender data is being collected to monitor diversity trends in staffing and to provide information to Command Staff for staffing-related decisions.
- **Identifying current assignments** – Personnel and human resources data is being collected and maintained for the establishment of baseline staffing and to implement Department staffing priorities.
- **Identifying vacancies** – Position control numbers have been created for positions that are currently vacant. The Staffing and Deployment Unit created a report and/or an organizational chart that displays the vacancies.
- **Tracking the employee history of a position** – Each position will have a historical record of which employees have held each position and the associated timeframe, which will be useful for monitoring organizational diversity.



Collaborative Reform Completion Memorandum

- **Tracking the position history of an employee** – Every employee will have a historical record of which positions they have held, which will be used for tracking professional development as it relates to specific assignments.
- **Creating organizational charts** – As each position is linked to a corresponding managerial position, organizational charts for the full department or for any Bureau or unit can be easily created.
- **Future staffing projections** – Multiple initiatives have been undertaken by the Staffing and Deployment Unit in order to enable the projection of future staffing needs as they relate to the City's growth and development.

The Staffing and Deployment Unit extracts demographic data from HRMS and combines it with rank data and assignment data (also from HRMS) via the data visualization software, Tableau, to create interactive dashboards that Command Staff can utilize (through Tableau Reader) to glean any necessary information for staffing decisions. The Staffing and Deployment Unit is maintaining historical data related to demographic trends as well. A dashboard has been created detailing a 10-year time series (2008-2018) of demographic breakdowns by race and by gender. This dashboard can be queried by rank and is available to Command Staff for review as needed. The Staffing and Deployment Unit continues to add year end demographic data annually. Also, demographic data as it relates to promotions has been collected and analyzed for all supervisory ranks (sergeant, lieutenant, captain, commander, deputy chief, assistant chief, and chief) by the Staffing and Deployment Unit. This information is maintained and updated by the Staffing and Deployment Unit on an ongoing basis as promotions occur.

Additionally, in an initial effort to accomplish some of the other aforementioned data priority tasks, the Staff Services Division created position arrays for Captain and Lieutenants, which informed executive management of the prior three members who have held managerial positions, such as Commanding Officer of the Police Academy. This enabled management to consider historical data regarding the diversity of different positions.

However, since this initial effort, the Staffing and Deployment Unit has developed a Position Control Number (PCN) system to automate the process (which was previously done by hand) and to improve the ease and comprehensiveness of this data collection. This Position Control Number system is comprised of unique identifiers for each position assignment in the Department. Employee IDs are linked to a PCN in our Human Resources Management System (HRMS) so that there is always a record of the exact position occupied by every employee in the department. Employees will be moved into and out of position control numbers as transfers and promotions occur. The Position Control Number system allows for easy accessibility to vacancy information and facilitates the creation of organizational charts.



Collaborative Reform Completion Memorandum

Tracking when and how employees move into and out of positions enables the Department to determine the employee history and demographic data of any particular position. Also, determining the position history of a particular employee enables the Department to track and encourage professional development.

Also, the Staffing and Deployment Unit has worked collaboratively with the City's Office of the Controller to develop interactive dashboards that incorporate calls for service data and human resources data into a workload based model that enables analysis of appropriate staffing levels for sector patrol at the District Stations. Initially, this project began as a point in time study. However, with the creation of Power BI dashboards that are updated at regular quarterly intervals, this data is now used continuously to inform whether staffing resources are allocated appropriately. This enables the Staffing and Deployment Unit to evaluate current patrol staffing needs as well as assists with the forecasting of future needs.

In addition to the aforementioned initiatives, the Staffing and Deployment Unit has also partnered with a private consulting firm, Matrix Consulting Group, to conduct and complete an in-depth detailed staffing analysis of the Department by individual Bureau. Matrix will generate and deliver a final report for the Department in the Spring of 2020. In addition to the final report, Matrix will provide the Department with an interactive tool that will allow the Staffing and Deployment Unit to regularly assess staffing needs based on the current data at hand on an ongoing basis.

Supporting Documents:

- ✓ PowerPoint: DOJ Recommendations 94.1 and 94.2, May 2019 (Attachment 21)
- ✓ Active Captains' Array – Assignment History – 9/15/17 (Attachment 22)
- ✓ Active Lieutenants' Array – Assignment History – 9/15/17 (Attachment 23)
- ✓ Position Control Number Overview (Attachment 20)
- ✓ Example Organization Chart of the Administration branch of the Administration Bureau (Attachment 32)
- ✓ Screen Capture of Workload Utilization Dashboard (Office of the Controller) (Attachment 24)
- ✓ Updated Project Schedule/Timeline from Matrix Consulting Group – May 15, 2019 (Attachment 25)

3) Develop and deliver data to managers.

Pursuant to this RFI, in 2019 Hillard Heintze determined SFPD completed compliance measure 3 as part of the department's initial response. The purpose of the Staffing and Deployment Unit is to collect, maintain and analyze personnel data to support department initiatives. The Staffing and Deployment Unit is the Chief's vision for executive-level support for setting and implementing the Department's staffing priorities.



Collaborative Reform Completion Memorandum

The Staffing and Deployment Unit's role is to be the analyzer and disseminator of personnel, human resources, and staffing related data.

The Staffing and Deployment Unit created and facilitates recurring bi-weekly staffing meetings with the Assistant Chiefs, Deputy Chiefs and the Staff Services Division beginning in early 2019. The Staffing and Deployment Unit prepares reports on personnel and human resources data for these meetings, which provides a forum for decision-makers to convene regularly to review and discuss this data. The establishment of this meeting has institutionalized the Department's employee data utilization.

Additionally, the Staffing and Deployment Unit has also created interactive Tableau dashboards containing demographic, rank, assignment, full duty status, succession planning, separation, and vacancy data (among other data) that is updated biweekly and provided to Command Staff, enabling them to have this data at their fingertips whenever needed.

Supporting Documents:

- ✓ PowerPoint: DOJ Recommendations 94.1 and 94.2, May 2019 (Attachment 21)
- ✓ SFPD Citywide Current Sworn Staffing (Full Duty Report) – 5/6/19 (Attachment 16)
- ✓ Police Positions – Budget Snapshot (April 26, 2019 / PO #8) (Tab 14)
- ✓ Command Staff Dashboards Table of Contents (Attachment 31)
- ✓ Race and Gender Dashboard (Attachment 7)
- ✓ Succession Planning: Age and Years of Service (Attachment 27)
- ✓ Full Duty and Not Full Duty Trend Analysis, Trend Analysis: Full Duty Q2s in Patrol (All District Stations), and Sworn Personnel by Bureau and Department ID (Attachment 29)
- ✓ Non-Training, Non-Service Separations: Overview, Non-Training or Service Separations: Drilldown, and Non-Training or Service Separations: Who? (Attachment 30)

4) Implement data-led management decisions.

Pursuant to this RFI, in 2019 Hillard Heintze determined SFPD completed compliance measure 3 as part of the department's initial response. The development and implementation of Position Control Numbers by the Staffing and Deployment Unit prioritizes maintaining personnel and human resources data to support informed management decisions across a myriad of different areas in the Department.

Additionally, the Staffing and Deployment Unit has created automated reports in the data visualization software Tableau that are produced on a bi-weekly basis and distributed to



Collaborative Reform Completion Memorandum

executive management, as well as discussed in detail in a staffing meeting that includes the Staffing and Deployment Unit, the Assistant Chiefs, and the Deputy Chiefs. These reports include:

- Budgeted and filled sworn and civilian positions by rank and funding source.
- A summary snapshot of full duty and not full duty personnel in the Department, which can be broken down by Bureau and rank.
- Succession planning reports.
- Separation data reports.
- Demographic breakdowns by rank and assignment.

While these reports are the end product, it is important to note that obtaining and tracking the data displayed therein required the development and subsequent processes for ongoing maintenance of the raw data in SFPD's human resource management system (HRMS). For example, the full duty report is based on a new field in HRMS that tracks whether or not an employee is "full duty" and the type of leave (e.g., disability pay, family-related) if the individual has a less than full duty status.

These initiatives are examples of the SFPD's efforts to prioritize the collection, maintenance and analysis of human resources and personnel data so that the information can support management decisions.

Supporting Documents:

- ✓ PowerPoint: DOJ Recommendations 94.1 and 94.2, May 2019 (Attachment 21)
- ✓ Example Meeting Agenda from February 24, 2020 (Attachment 26)
- ✓ Police Positions – Budget Snapshot (April 26, 2019 / PO #8) (Attachment 14)
- ✓ Vacant Position Report – 8/21/19 (Attachment 13)
- ✓ SFPD Citywide Current Sworn Staffing (Full Duty Report) – 5/6/19 (Attachment 16)
- ✓ Police Terminations by Category – 8/21/19 (Attachment 17)
- ✓ Command Staff Dashboards Table of Contents (Attachment 31)
- ✓ Race and Gender Dashboard (Attachment 7)
- ✓ Succession Planning: Age and Years of Service (Attachment 27)
- ✓ Full Duty and Not Full Duty Trend Analysis, Trend Analysis: Full Duty Q2s in Patrol (All District Stations), and Sworn Personnel by Bureau and Department ID (Attachment 29)
- ✓ Non-Training, Non-Service Separations: Overview, Non-Training or Service Separations: Drilldown, and Non-Training or Service Separations: Who? (Attachment 30)

5) Identify areas of potential improvement and implement where necessary.



Collaborative Reform Completion Memorandum

Pursuant to this RFI, in 2019 Hillard Heintze determined SFPD completed compliance measure 3 as part of the department's initial response. The Staffing and Deployment Unit continues to review and improve its processes through feedback from within the unit as well as from executive management and external stakeholders. The Staffing and Deployment Unit meets weekly, as a team, to discuss data findings, data needs, and data issues and to brainstorm solutions and goals. The Staffing and Deployment Unit also meets biweekly with Administration Bureau Command Staff to disseminate information and problem solve. These meetings are in addition to the biweekly meetings held by the Staffing and Deployment Unit with the Assistant Chiefs and Deputy Chiefs.

Externally, as mentioned previously, the Staffing and Deployment Unit has worked collaboratively with the City's Office of the Controller to develop interactive dashboards that incorporate calls for service data and human resources data into a workload based model that enables analysis of appropriate staffing levels for sector patrol at the District Stations. These dashboards are now being updated at regular quarterly intervals and this data is now used continuously to inform whether staffing resources are allocated appropriately, enabling the Staffing and Deployment Unit to evaluate current patrol staffing needs and forecast future needs. Up to this point, these dashboards have primarily been used by the Staffing and Deployment Unit and certain members of Command Staff. However, in the last two months, the Office of the Controller trained almost all SFPD Command Staff and Captains on how to take full advantage of all that the interactive dashboards have to offer, workload analysis-wise and beyond. One additional training session is forthcoming to train the few remaining Command Staff members and Captains who were unable to attend the previously scheduled trainings.

As also mentioned previously, the Staffing and Deployment Unit is working with the SFPD Strategic Management Bureau to manage an external consulting firm that is conducting a comprehensive staffing analysis of the department. The results of the staffing analysis have been shared with a Staffing Task Force made up of data analysts, experts, and community members; the Staffing and Deployment Unit is co-managing the Staffing Task Force to ensure that stakeholder feedback is incorporated into the results.

As the Staffing and Deployment Unit undertakes projects, it is documenting initiatives and procedures that will eventually populate a comprehensive manual and standard operating procedures for the Unit.

Supporting Documents:

- ✓ Example Staffing and Deployment Unit Fiscal Year 2019-20 Running Check-Ins Agenda (Attachment 33)
- ✓ Example Bi-Weekly Staffing and Deployment Unit Meeting Agenda (Attachment 26)
- ✓ Example Meeting Agenda from February 24th, 2020 (Attachment 26)
- ✓ Screen Capture of Workload Utilization Dashboard (Office of the Controller) (Attachment 24)



Collaborative Reform Completion Memorandum

- ✓ Updated Project Schedule/Timeline from Matrix Consulting Group – May 15, 2019 (Attachment 25)