



## Recommendation 85.2

Gabriel Martinez [Redacted]

Tue 1/5/2021 10:24 AM

[Redacted]

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

Dear Acting Captain Altorfer,

Our office has completed its review of the materials related to Recommendation 85.2 that were submitted to us as part of the collaborative reform process. This package focused on SFPD considering increasing resources to engage underrepresented communities in its recruiting efforts. After reviewing the package and information provided by the Department, the California Department of Justice finds as follows:

Recommendation 85.2: The SFPD should consider assigning more resources, by way of community outreach and recruiting officers, to further engage underrepresented communities.

Response to 85.2: SFPD's Recruitment Unit has six full-time staff members. These staff members work with part-time recruiters (currently 81) to ensure SFPD participates at various recruitment events, such as job fairs, college presentations, and workout sessions. The SFPD Recruitment Unit also attends numerous San Francisco cultural events, including Chinese New Year Street Fair, SF Carnaval, and Advancing the Dream Career Fair. In 2019 SFPD attended 219 events, including 46 first-time events. SFPD has also held recruiting events at dozens of California colleges throughout the state, from Humboldt to Fresno to Long Beach in 2019.

The Recruitment Unit uses applicant tracking sheets, event summaries, and recruit surveys (among other surveys) to evaluate the effectiveness of SFPD's recruitment. The Recruitment Unit also meets with Police Employee Groups (e.g., the Women's Action Committee, the Pride Alliance, and the Latin Police Officers Association) annually for assistance in recruiting and outreach, and the Police Employee Groups also provide the Recruitment Unit recruiting suggestions. The Recruitment Unit publishes a Year End Review Report on all its recruitment efforts, which includes GIS mapping that is reviewed to ensure recruiting events occur in a diversity of locations.

Additionally, SFPD has leveraged its community network to expand its outreach. SFPD created a Community Ambassador program to identify and train community leaders to support SFPD's recruitment process. The Community Ambassador Program is being implemented in all twelve SFPD districts. SFPD held district station meetings with information regarding the ambassador program in ten of the twelve district stations between November 2019 and February 2020, and has committed to hold additional meetings for the remaining two district stations when the regular district station meetings resume. During these meetings, the Recruitment Unit presents and provides training to community leaders interested in becoming a part of the Community Ambassador Program. This includes providing information on finding applicants, mentorship, test prep help, the hiring process, minimum qualifications, and how to overcome common barriers. The Recruitment Unit solicits feedback and yearly surveys from Community Ambassadors in a process that has been formalized in Unit Order 20-02 ("Recruitment Unit -



Year End Review Report,” issued August 1, 2020). The Order also commits to annual district station presentations and training for the Community Ambassador Program.

Based upon all of the above, the Department of Justice finds that SFPD is in substantial compliance with this recommendation. Please let us know if you have any questions or would like to discuss further. Thank you.

CONFIDENTIALITY NOTICE: This communication with its contents may contain confidential and/or legally privileged information. It is solely for the use of the intended recipient(s). Unauthorized interception, review, use or disclosure is prohibited and may violate applicable laws including the Electronic Communications Privacy Act. If you are not the intended recipient, please contact the sender and destroy all copies of the communication.





## Collaborative Reform Completion Memorandum

**Finding #85:** The SFPD's Recruitment Unit has implemented an active recruitment program focused on diversity and targeted recruiting throughout San Francisco but does not measure or validate the effectiveness of their outreach and events.

**Recommendation # 85.2** The SFPD should consider assigning more resources, by way of community outreach and recruiting officers, to further engage underrepresented communities.

**RFI Response Date: 10/19/20**

### Executive Summary:

#### **Assigning more resources:**

To assign more resources by way of community outreach, the Recruitment Unit (RU) has expanded and strengthened its relationships with California colleges. This expanded outreach has allowed the RU to reach colleges inherently diverse student populations. The RU has also implemented a Community Ambassador program in all ten District Police Stations to support recruitment efforts. To assign more resources by way of recruiting officers, the full time RU members are supported by part time recruiters who are available as needed for RU events/activities. The RU also partners with the Police Employee Groups (PEG groups) to elicit suggestions, recommendations and assistance in recruiting outreach and events.

#### **Measure effectiveness:**

The RU has established these four measures to determine effectiveness of recruiting activities: a Tracking Sheet to track candidates, completing Event Summaries, collecting numerous surveys and completing a Year End Review Report. The RU has identified these two areas needed for improvement: utilize a Text Messaging Platform to communicate with potential applicants and hire a Marketing Company to assist with SFPD recruitment.

### Compliance Measures

**1. Evidence of consideration of assigning more community outreach and recruiting officers to support recruitment efforts.**

**"For compliance measure 1, SFPD will include additional examples of ways it considered (and implemented, to the extent relevant) increasing community outreach and recruiting officers to support recruitment efforts, specifically in underrepresented communities. Some examples that Hillard Heintze thought of include conducting testing at a wide variety of locations, recruiting on college campuses, and consideration of ideas that came out of meetings with PEG groups."**



## Collaborative Reform Completion Memorandum

### **Community outreach to support recruitment efforts:**

The SFPD RU has sought to use California colleges and universities for recruitment events due to their inherently diverse student populations. By seeking out these partnerships, the RU has expanded and strengthened its relationships with these higher learning institutions, resulting in recruitment outreach to their diverse pool of candidates. In 2019 the RU attended recruiting opportunities or hosted recruiting events in the following California college campuses: City College of San Francisco, San Francisco State University, University of San Francisco, Cal State University East Bay, Solano College, Cal State University Long Beach, Mt. St. Mary's University, Chabot College, Mendocino College, Cal State University San Marcos, Point Loma Nazarene University, Cal State University Northridge, Cal State University San Bernadino, Cal Baptist University, Azusa Pacific University, Cal State University Dominguez Hills, Cal State University Los Angeles, Cal State University Fullerton, Laney College, Sacramento State University, Los Positas College, Holy Names University, Diablo Valley College, Palo Alto University, Cal State Stanislaus, San Jose State University, Cal State University Chico, Fresno Pacific University, Humboldt State University, Cal State University Fresno, Modesto Junior College

See **Attachment 7** 2019 Year End Review pages 11-20

Based on DOJ Recommendation 85.3, the SFPD expanded its community partnerships and outreach by creating a community ambassador program to identify and train community leaders to support in the SFPD's recruitment process. Because the program is being implemented in all district stations, which are strategically located throughout the city neighborhoods, we are able to find interested members from all over the city. In addition, the commitment to continued expansion of the program throughout the city and acceptance of new members from different walks of life will engage underrepresented communities.

To create a Recruitment Community Ambassador Program, the Department decided to reach out to all ten District Station Captains to ask for their assistance in contacting community leaders. The RU was invited to attend pre-existing meetings with community members that each district Captain had scheduled. Sergeant Christina Serrano and Recruiter Luciana Ng attended the meetings listed below:

- 11/18/19 - Richmond Station - CPAB Meeting 5:30pm
- 11/19/19 - Ingleside Station - Community Meeting 7:00pm
- 11/26/19 - Mission Station - CPAB Meeting 5:00pm
- 1/7/20 - Academy - Women's Forum Meeting 6:00pm
- 1/9/20 - Southern Station - CPAB Meeting 6:00pm
- 1/14/20 - Park Station - Community Meeting 7:00pm
- 1/29/20 - Tenderloin Station - CPAB 1:00pm
- 2/4/20 - Bayview Station - CPAB 5:00pm



## Collaborative Reform Completion Memorandum

- 2/4/20 – Bayview Station - Community Meeting 6:00pm
- 2/19/20 - Central Station - CPAB Meeting 4:00pm

Due to COVID- 19 and SIP (Shelter in Place) orders all district station meetings have been postponed. The Recruitment Unit will attend meetings at Northern Station and Taraval Station once those stations start hosting their meetings again. That will fulfill a complete representation of all ten District Stations throughout San Francisco.

During these meetings, the RU did a presentation and provided training to those community leaders interested in becoming part of the Recruitment Community Ambassador Program. Members of the RU trained the Community Ambassadors by presenting information regarding what the SFPD RU currently does to locate applicants, mentor applicants and assist them with test prep help. We also presented information regarding the hiring process, the testing steps, the minimum qualifications, the most common barriers or hurdles that applicants face and what the applicant can do to overcome them. The training presentations ended with a Q & A session along with suggestions and feedback. During this training the Ambassadors were provided flyers and referral cards to assist them in their efforts to recruit within their communities.

The RU created a contact list of the members who agreed to become Community Ambassadors. The Community Ambassadors were sent a welcome email and a follow up email along with a survey to complete. The Community Ambassadors were also reached via email and telephone to encourage them to complete the survey. The survey asked the Community Ambassadors 12 questions pertaining to recruitment efforts. This survey allows the RU to formally and continuously receive feedback from the Community Ambassadors. This feedback will assist the RU in analyzing its current effectiveness. The Community Ambassadors can provide suggestions, strategies and improvements that the RU can review and implement when feasible. Unit Order 20-02 ensures the RU will conduct a similar survey yearly. The Unit Order also states the RU will coordinate the district station presentations and training yearly. The surveys, the presentation/training summaries, and a list of the Community Ambassadors will be made available for review in the Staff Services-Recruitment Unit shared desktop folder. The Recruitment Unit memorandum describing this program will serve as an outline and a reference for the RU member tasked with running the program.

See [Attachment 1](#) Unit Order 20-02

See [Attachment 2](#) Recruitment Unit memorandum

See [Attachment 3](#) Emails to Captains

See [Attachment 4](#) Community Ambassador roster

See [Attachment 5](#) The Meeting Summaries

See [Attachment 6](#) Recruitment Community Ambassador Program survey

**Recruiting officers to support recruitment efforts:**



## Collaborative Reform Completion Memorandum

The Recruitment Unit currently has six dedicated full time staff members that represent very diverse backgrounds. To support the dedicated recruiters and assist community outreach efforts the RU maintains a group of part time recruiters. These are officers who have specifically applied to assist the RU with recruiting efforts. They are vetted through our Internal Affairs Unit to ensure suitability for representing the SFPD at events and in advertising. The part time recruiters are trained by the full time recruiters. The part time recruiters assist at job fairs, college presentations, test prep sessions and applicant workout sessions. Currently there are eighty-one part time recruiters that represent very diverse backgrounds. The diversity of both full time recruiters and part time recruiters is documented in the 2019 Year End Review.

See Attachment 7 2019 Year End Review pages 4-6

The RU meets with the Police Employee Groups (PEG groups) yearly to elicit suggestions, recommendations and assistance in recruiting outreach and events. The PEG groups represent and serve not only police officers but they also represent and serve many different communities in San Francisco and the Bay Area. At the beginning of 2019 the RU met with the PEG groups individually. A summary of those meetings was generated. At the beginning of 2020 the RU met with the PEG groups for a single group meeting. The 2020 meeting began with a review of the 2019 meeting summary and the RU presented which suggestions from the previous year had been implemented. New suggestions were collected and documented in the 2020 PEG group meeting minutes.

See Attachment 14 PEG group meeting summaries for 2019 and 2020

See Attachment 1 Unit Order 20-02

**2. If decided to act, additional officers used to support recruitment efforts/engagement with underrepresented communities. If decided not to act, include an explanation and evidence of how the current plan is adequate.**

**"For compliance measure 2, Cal DOJ asked that SFPD explain how the Department is allocating existing resources in the Recruitment Unit to engage with underrepresented communities. This can include examples of recruitment outreach actions and events in underrepresented communities."**

Currently the SFPD has a dedicated Recruitment Unit with six full time members and eighty-one part time recruiters. RU is hiring interested part time members on a continuous basis. The size of the RU full time members is not currently expected to increase. The number of part time recruiters will fluctuate year to year. Depending on members' interest in the part time



## Collaborative Reform Completion Memorandum

position, we will see members leave, not meeting eligibility to participate and new part time recruiters join. The SFPD has always committed to staffing the full time unit with diverse members. That being said, the part timer recruiters bring a much larger representation of diversity to the recruitment efforts. Our current plan is to maintain the number of the full time members in the RU and supplement staffing with part timer recruiters as needed. Having this many recruitment members as resources, allows the RU to select very diverse members to represent the SFPD at recruiting events and in advertisements. The evidence of this plan being more than adequate is shown in the diversity of recruits entering new Academy classes. Evidence of this information can be found in the Academy Class Demographics Report attachment.

See **Attachment 8** Academy class demographics

The SFPD's commitment to locating diverse applicants from underrepresented communities is further displayed in the RUs effort to provide equitable focused assistance throughout the hiring process. These efforts ensure that our diverse applicants have a better chance at succeeding in their pursuit of a career with the SFPD.

- The San Francisco Department of Human Resources(DHR) provides the RU access to all applicant contact information. The SFPD RU offers mentorship to every applicant. The RU emails and calls every applicant and answers all applicant questions.
- The RU provides written test prep help by providing tips over the phone and directing applicants to the online practice test.
- The RU provides physical test prep help by providing monthly practice sessions. The RU provides additional physical conditioning help by providing monthly workout sessions.
- The RU provides oral board test prep help by providing monthly practice sessions.
- Numerous times throughout the year the RU provides testing in various locations outside of San Francisco. This eliminates multiple, costly trips to San Francisco for testing.
- DHR provides a fee waiver program for applicants who need financial assistance with the \$49 written test fee. The RU has coordinated with DHR an additional event based voucher program to waive the written test fee when the RU is conducting testing remotely.
- DHR allows out of area applicants to take their oral boards test virtually.
- The SFPD Background Unit attempts to schedule numerous testing components on a single weekend for out of area applicants. This eliminates multiple, costly trips to San Francisco for testing.

In addition to these diversity focused recruitment efforts/resources and the expanded college outreach listed in compliance measure #1, the RU participates in numerous other ethnic/cultural/lifestyle recruiting events each year. In 2019 the RU attended: Advancing the



## Collaborative Reform Completion Memorandum

Dream Career Fair, Chinese New Year Street Fair, Diversity Job Fair, San Francisco Carnaval, Pista Sa Nasyon, various Fit Expos and sporting events, various Pride celebrations, BeINVINCIBLE Women's Summit, Kalayaan, Oakland Lakefest, SF Housing Authority Job Fair, Diversity Career Group, various Safety Fairs, Bay Area Bilingual and Diversity Career Fair, various Art Festivals, Adobo Festival, Pistahan, Professional Women Returning to Work Career Fair, Choose Peace Stop Violence, Fiestas Patrias, Salsa Festival, Pacific Islander Festival, etc. To see a complete list of events, see the 2019 Year End Review.

See **Attachment 7** 2019 Year End Review pages 11-15

### **3. If decided to act, establish measures for determining effectiveness of recruitment activities and identify areas needed for improvement.**

The RU has established these four measures to determine effectiveness of recruiting activities: a Tracking Sheet to track candidates, completing Event Summaries, collecting numerous surveys and completing a Year End Review Report.

#### **Tracking Sheet**

All RU efforts related to applicant hiring success, take a minimum of six months to a year to assess. This is typically how long it takes an applicant to make it through the testing process. This calls for long term tracking. The Recruitment Unit is tasked with tracking all interested applicants and candidates who are currently in the hiring process. Tracking information includes: name, ethnicity, gender, age, address, phone number, email address, school and the event location and date of contact. If the candidate is in the hiring process, their testing results are also collected (application, written test, physical abilities test, oral board interview). Individual recruiters are assigned follow-ups with each applicant to engage them throughout the process. The recruiters provide assistance and mentorship. Currently the candidate's information is contained on a shared Tracking Sheet on SFPD's One-Drive Office 365 server.

See **Attachment 9** blank Tracking Sheet Sample and redacted Tracking Sheet Sample

#### **Event Summaries**

After a RU member attends an event, they complete an Event Summary. The completed Event Summary is submitted to the RU Sergeant for review. Once reviewed, the Sergeant signs the bottom of the form and it is scanned into the Staff Services-Recruitment shared desktop folder for future reference. The Event Summaries are used to complete a RU Year End Review Report. The Event Summaries are often reviewed for past event information. The RU's supervisors (Staff Services Lieutenant, Staff Services Captain, Administration Bureau Commander and Administration Bureau Deputy Chief) often ask for the RU to review previous Event Summaries before they decide to approve the RU's attendance at an event again.

See **Attachment 10** Blank Event Summary

See **Attachment 7** 2019 Year End Review pages 9-10





## Collaborative Reform Completion Memorandum

### Surveys

The five surveys listed below are collected on an ongoing basis. They are reviewed by the RU and forwarded to supervisors through the chain of command. When each survey/report is completed it is presented at the next scheduled quarterly SFPD/DHR Hiring Committee Meeting. All members present at the meeting are provided with a copy and members who were invited but did not attend are sent a digital copy.

- The RU continues to collect the, "How Did You Hear About Us?" surveys. The Background Investigation Unit includes this survey when sending out their background packet information to applicants that have reached that stage in the hiring process. These are people who are approximately half way through the hiring process and they represent a wide range of diverse communities. The survey asks for the person to identify where or how they initially were exposed to the SFPD, if they had any contact with the RU specifically, if they attended any of the RU's test prep sessions, suggestions for other RU events and general suggestions. When the applicant mails in their survey it is forwarded to the RU. The RU reviews the information and generates survey reports.
- Since 11/21/18, the RU surveys all recruits when hired for the San Francisco Police Academy by using SurveyMonkey. A link is sent to them by email and each recruit is required to complete the survey. These people have made it through a long and selective hiring process. They represent the most qualified and successful applicants. They also represent a wide range of diverse communities. These surveys collect information related to where they were recruited from, background information, education, exposure to SFPD recruitment advertisements, exposure to RU members, access to test prep sessions, experience during the hiring process, general feedback and suggestions. The RU prints the completed surveys and reviews them.
- As of 08/16/19, a General Feedback survey is sent to every person the RU makes contact with at a recruiting event. A SurveyMonkey link is sent to their email. The survey collects information related to the event where they made contact with the RU, their initial perception of the RU staff, their satisfaction regarding the time and attention provided to them, what other events they suggest for the RU to attend, information regarding the RU test prep sessions and general feedback. The RU prints the completed survey report and reviews it.
- RU meets with the Police Employee Groups (PEG groups) yearly to elicit suggestions, recommendations and assistance in recruiting outreach and events. The PEG groups represent and serve not only police officers but they also



## Collaborative Reform Completion Memorandum

represent and serve many different communities in San Francisco and the Bay Area. At the beginning of 2019 the RU met with the PEG groups individually. A summary of those meetings was generated. At the beginning of 2020 the RU met with the PEG groups for a single group meeting. The 2020 meeting began with a review of the 2019 meeting summary and the RU presented which suggestions from the previous year had been implemented. New suggestions were collected and documented in the 2020 PEG group meeting minutes.

- Based on DOJ Recommendation 85.3, the SFPD RU has implemented a Recruitment Community Ambassador Program. This program is designed to identify community leaders who are willing to assist in SFPDs recruitment efforts. One component of this program is a yearly survey of the community members who participate in the program. This survey allows the RU to elicit feedback and suggestions from community members regarding recruitment efforts. It also encourages the community members to assist in recruitment efforts.

See Attachment 11 "How Did You Hear About Us Survey?"

See Attachment 12 Class #270<sup>th</sup>, #271<sup>st</sup> and #272<sup>nd</sup>

See Attachment 13 General Feedback Survey

See Attachment 14 PEG group meeting summaries for 2019 and 2020

See Attachment 6 Recruitment Community Ambassador Program survey

### **Year End Review**

Each year the RU completes a Year End Review Report. Once completed, a printed copy is distributed to each member of the RU, the RU Sergeant, the Staff Services Lieutenant, the Staff Services Captain, the Administration Bureau Commander and the Administration Bureau Deputy Chief. Those listed members keep their printed copy on file and are also provided a digital version if requested. Numerous copies of the report are kept in the RU's office area and provided to Command Staff upon request. The report is stored in the Staff Services-Recruitment shared desktop folder. Copies of the report are also provided to the quarterly Hiring Committee Meeting members.

See Attachment 7 2019 Year End Review Report

### **Areas for improvement**

The RU has identified these two areas needed for improvement: utilize a Text Messaging Platform to communicate with potential applicants and hire a Marketing Company to assist with SFPD recruitment branding. We selected a text messaging platform called Interview Now and got approval to work with them. Just as we started using the Text Messaging Platform, the SF



## **Collaborative Reform Completion Memorandum**

Mayor initiated a hiring freeze for the SFPD. We have not been able to continue using this platform but we intend on moving forward with this company again as soon as the hiring freeze is lifted. We selected a marketing company named Epic Productions and got approval to start initial branding work with them but COVID-19 restrictions and the hiring freeze have prevented us from starting this work. Our intention is to still move forward towards working with a Marketing Company when we are able to.