Recommendation 87.2

Tanya Koshy ▮▮▮▮▮▮▮▮▮▮▮▮▮▮▮▮▮▮▮
Thu 4/8/2021 5:18 PM

▮▮

To:

- McGuire, Catherine (POL);
- Scott, William (POL);
- ▮▮▮▮▮▮▮▮▮▮▮▮▮▮▮▮▮▮▮▮▮▮▮

+8 others

> This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

Dear Acting Captain Altorfer,

Our office has completed its review of the materials related to Recommendation 87.2 that have been submitted to us as part of the collaborative reform process. After reviewing the package and information provided by the Department, the California Department of Justice finds as follows:

Recommendation 87.2:

The SFPD should evaluate the overall background investigation process including the demographics of candidates interviewed and progressed for hiring decisions.

Response to Recommendation 87.2:

SFPD, in collaboration with the City of San Francisco's Department of Human Resources and the University of California, Goldman School of Public Policy, conducted an evaluation of its recruitment and hiring practices. The final report was completed in May 2018 and, as part of that evaluation, the Goldman School recommended that SFPD implement better data collection practices. As part of those better data collection practices, the Goldman School recommended that the Background Unit collect candidate information—such as race, gender, and age—in a single database to support "rigorous and predictive analysis." To that end, the Background Unit now uses a master spreadsheet to track candidates as they progress through the background investigations process. When the Background Unit receives a candidate's packet, a staff member (clerk) enters the candidate's information into the master spreadsheet. The master spreadsheet has dropdown menus rather than open text fields enabling data, so that data is entered consistently. The spreadsheet includes relevant fields to capture candidate information, as suggested by the Goldman School, including race, gender, age, education status, psychological scores, etc.

In addition to this master spreadsheet, each background investigator also keeps track of their individual assignments via a standardized case status tracker sheet that tracks various categories of information about each applicant for employment, including the applicant's name, sex, race, and age. This case tracker is described in more detail in the package for Recommendation 87.1.

On a quarterly basis, SFPD holds a Recruitment and Retention meeting, attended by the Deputy Chief and Commander of the Administration Bureau, Captain and Lieutenant of the Staff Services Division, the Officer in Charge of the Recruitment and Background Investigations Units, Captain of the Police Academy, the Officer in Charge of the Field Training Division and the City of San Francisco's Department of Human Resources Public Safety Team. Among their tasks during this meeting, meeting attendees review a report, prepared by Staff Services Senior Administrative Analyst, that summarizes the race and gender of the entire applicant pool and the people hired to enter the Academy. This data is compiled from the master spreadsheet. SFPD also provided evidence that this data can be broken down further to show the racial and gender demographics of candidates at each stage of the hiring process.

Based upon all of the above, the Department of Justice finds that SFPD is in substantial compliance with this recommendation. Please let us know if you have any questions or would like to discuss this further.

Tanya

Tanya S. Koshy (she/her)
Deputy Attorney General
Civil Rights Enforcement Section
California Department of Justice
1515 Clay Street, Suite 2100
Oakland, CA 94612
████████████
████████████████████

Collaborative Reform Completion Memorandum

Finding # 87: The Background Investigation Unit lacks valid performance measures to evaluate background investigators.

Recommendation # 87.2 The SFPD should evaluate the overall background investigation process including the demographics of candidates interviewed and progressed for hiring decisions.

Response Date: 03/08/2021

Executive Summary: The SFPD Staff Services Division conducts ongoing analysis of the demographics of the candidates that progress through the hiring process, including SFPD's background investigations. The analysis includes a comparative breakdown of the race and gender of applicants in background investigations, an analysis of the status of candidates (e.g., percentage of candidates who are disqualified for various factors and the percentage of candidates who are hired), and a breakdown of status by race and gender. (attachment #5) The Staff Services Division continually tracks this information in a format which allows these analyses to be done at any time, facilitating a repeatable process that can be completed on a routine basis.

Additionally, the Staff Services Division has created and implemented Unit Orders to ensure fair and transparent guidelines and investigative steps throughout the background process (attachment #3).

Compliance Measures:

1) **Evidence of a whole program review of the background investigation process.**

   SFPD Recruitment and Background Investigations Units collaborated with the San Francisco Department of Human Resources (DHR), and a Goldman School of Public Policy MPP candidate, Anna Duning, to conduct an evaluation and review titled "San Francisco's Police Officers: Recruiting and Hiring in a New Era." The final report was presented in May 2018 to DHR, SFPD team members and stakeholders and serves as an official evaluation of the background investigations process. (attachment #1) The report includes recommendations on data management, most significantly that SFPD Backgrounds should "[establish] better data collection practices" through improvements such as [quoted from report]:

   • Convert open text fields to drop-down menus with a pre-established list of options and eliminate open text fields where possible.

- Include all relevant fields for candidates including age, education status, hometown, race, gender, psychological scores, etc.
- Eliminate redundant systems that are time-consuming to update, but do not serve a specified business purpose.

The Administration Bureau Management (Commander, Captain and Lieutenant of Staff Services and Officer-in-Charge of Background Investigations Unit) has further continuously reviewed the overall operations of the Background Investigations Unit.

The following Unit Orders for Staff Services and the Background Investigation Unit have been drafted and implemented to ensure fair and transparent guidelines and investigative steps throughout the background process:

Unit Order 19-02- Protocols and guidelines for Hiring City Employees
Unit Order 21-01– Background Investigative Process
Unit Order 18-01- Mandatory Contact with Applicants in Background Investigations
Unit Order 17-05- SFPD/DHR Recruiting and Hiring Committee

See Attachment 1: An evaluation and review titled "San Francisco's Police Officers: Recruiting and Hiring in a New Era", conducted by Goldman School of Public Policy MPP candidate Anna Duning.

See Attachment 2: PowerPoint of Recruitment, Background Investigations and Hiring that was presented on January 29, 2019 to SFPD Command Staff.

See Attachment 3: Unit Orders

2) **Breakdown of demographics of candidates interviewed and progressed.**

As of September 2018, the SFPD has made improvements to the previously existing data collection systems.

The Background Unit now uses a master spreadsheet as the sole source of tracking candidates as they progress through the background investigations process. When the Background Unit receives a candidate's packet, a staff member (clerk) enters the candidate's information into the master spreadsheet. This master spreadsheet has dropdown menus rather than open text fields enabling data to be entered consistently and any analytical questions (e.g., how many candidates had "non-select" disqualifications) that may arise can be answered instantly. The Background Unit Sergeant then assigns the packet to an investigator. The background investigator is then in charge of completing the rest of the fields in the master spreadsheet Moreover, the spreadsheet includes relevant fields to capture candidate information such as race, gender, age, education status, psychological scores, etc. This master spreadsheet is an addition to the individual tracking sheets that each background investigator is responsible for filling out for each candidate they are assigned as mentioned in DOJ Recommendation 87.1. The

data that is input into the spreadsheet, automatically updates into the Tableau Software. The Tableau software then creates visualizations such as pie charts, graphs, etc. that are used for internal and external presentations, meetings and whenever someone has a question about demographics.

Staff Services and the Background Unit have continuously collected and analyzed data including a comparative breakdown of the race and gender of applicants in background investigations. Staff Services conducted an analysis of the status of candidates (e.g., percentage of candidates who are disqualified for various factors and the percentage of candidates who are hired), and a breakdown of status by race and gender. Additionally, Staff Services has provided an analysis of Hiring Meeting results with a breakdown of race and gender of recruits entering each Academy class.

Collecting data more accurately and more consistently has enabled SFPD to easily answer key questions that improve operational performance. For example, the Backgrounds Unit can determine how many candidates are in backgrounds that meet certain criteria and can target follow-up efforts accordingly.

See Attachment 4: Master Spreadsheet for 2020

See Attachment 5: Data analysis and graphs of gender and race breakdown

3) **Evidence of ongoing review and improvement.**

SFPD Backgrounds holds hiring meetings as needed where investigators present candidates to the Background Unit's Supervising Sergeant and Captain of Staff Services Division for preliminary hiring decisions, contingent on final stage checks like medical clearance. Directly following these hiring meetings, Staff Services Sr. Administrative Analyst generates a report on candidate demographic information such as race and gender. This report is built in the data visualization software Tableau, which makes it nearly effortless to create a current report as data is appended. This " Hiring Summary" shows the race and gender breakdown of the current pool in the respective hiring meeting, as well as a rolling summary from March 2018, when these reports were implemented, onward. The Hiring Summary provides information on candidate demographics to the Captain of Staff Services Division. The demographic breakdowns from a sample hiring summary are attached.

This data is also reviewed and discussed at quarterly Recruiting and Hiring Committee meetings attended by the Deputy Chief and Commander of the Administration Bureau, Captain and Lieutenant of the Staff Services Division, OIC of Recruitment and Background Investigations Units, Captain of the Police Academy, OIC of the Field Training Division and DHR (Public Safety Team). These policy improvements are benefiting the SFPD by making data readily available so that analytical insights can be factored into decision making processes.

Collaborative Reform Completion Memorandum

As mentioned previously Unit Orders for the Background Investigation Unit have been developed to further improve this portion of the hiring process. Unit Order 18-01 establishes "Mandatory Contact with Applicants in Backgrounds Investigations".

See Attachment 6: Hiring Meeting Summary Data

On 2/18/21, this recommendation was presented at a prescreen meeting with Hillard Heintze and CalDOJ. The below noted comments were provided:

"Cal DOJ thought that SFPD could add the demographic information of candidates before, during, and after the background investigation and its efforts to identify any potential issues with the background investigation process."

Demographic information is tracked for candidates before and after the background investigation. It should be noted that though this information is tracked(before and after the background investigation begins), it does not involve the background investigation process. The tracking of demographic data is explained in the Diversity Strategic Plan which contains the following,

Diversity in Recruitment (BEFORE background investigation) – this section pertains to the Department of Human Resources (DHR), the centralized city department that handles the application and testing process for the Q2 Police Officer position, and the SFPD Recruitment Unit, which operates recruitment events and serves as a resource for candidates through the application and testing process. All of this information is laid out in detail in the "Strategic Goal 1" section of the Diversity Strategic Plan.

DHR provides SFPD with the following data on a quarterly* basis:
- Count of candidates by race and gender for the following components of the hiring process: applications, qualified applications, those who show up for and pass the written, oral and physical ability tests
- Passage rates by race and gender for all testing components

The Recruitment Unit tracks the following information:
- Number of recruitment events, including the number of attendees, and the number of contacts made
- Classification of each event based on the population targeted (e.g., if the event is at City College, it would be classified as "Local")

This data is analyzed on an ongoing basis and discussed at the Quarterly Recruitment and Hiring Meetings, which include DHR, Recruitment Unit, Backgrounds Unit, Training Division, and Staffing and Deployment.

PSPPB Form 2001 v2

Collaborative Reform Completion Memorandum

Diversity in Police Officer Training (AFTER background investigation) – this section pertains to the Training Division, including the Basic Recruit Course and the Field Training Office (FTO). All of this information is laid out in the "Strategic Goal 3" section of the Diversity Strategic Plan.

The Basic Recruit Course maintains a dataset that shows, for each class and each year, the number of separations, the type of separation (release or resignation), more detailed information on the type of separation, and the race and gender of the graduating class as well as those who separated. Moreover, for both the Basic Recruit Course as well as for Field Training, SFPD's Human Resources Management System (HRMS) houses all personal biographical information, as well as hiring and separation dates, for further analysis.

Data is reviewed at the Quarterly Recruitment and Hiring Meetings, and data on separations at the Basic Recruit Course and FTO is also analyzed and included in the series of dashboards that are presented at the bi-weekly meetings that SDU leads with the Assistant and Deputy Chiefs.

1. **Long-term support and Professional Development (AFTER background investigation)** – this section pertains to retention within the department. SDU is in charge of tracking, analyzing and presenting data on retention. All of this is laid out in in the "Strategic Goal 4" section of the Diversity Strategic Plan.

   SDU tracks separation data across the broad categories of retirements, non-training separations and non-service retirements, and training separations. For each of these categories, SDU has done deeper analyses into the specifics of each separation type. For training records, SFPD has an Oracle BI data warehouse that enables report generation and ad hoc queries.

   Separation records are reviewed on a bi-weekly basis at the meeting that SDU has with the Assistant and Deputy Chiefs.

Data Sources

The following are the data sources and datasets that SFPD uses to store, track, analyze and present data. This is where the data is stored and subsequently acquired for the performance measures listed in the Diversity Strategic Plan.

1. Human Resources Management System (HRMS) – this system is the central and consistent source for all personnel-related data in the department. SDU utilizes HRMS extensively for ongoing reporting.
2. Oracle BI – this is primarily a report generation system, but since various data sources can be combined in the interface (e.g., training and biographical information), BI is used extensively for generating ad hoc reporting.

3. Datasets maintained by specific units such as Recruitment, Backgrounds, Basic Recruit Course, etc. – individual units track, store and maintain their own data, which in turn is used for analysis to inform the performance measures in the Diversity Strategic Plan.

In an effort to identify potential issues in the Background Investigation process, Unit order was prepared to address how Supervisors review the performance of background investigators throughout the process of the background investigation they conduct on each candidate. This is also addressed in Rec 87.1. (Background Investigative Process unit order)

On Thursday, 03/08/21, this recommendation was presented at a prescreen meeting with Hillard Heintze and CalDOJ. The below noted comments were provided

Hillard Heintze thought that SFPD had done well to collect demographic data, but would like to see a plan for comparing investigators across that data. For instance, was one particular investigator slower when advancing women or minorities? SFPD will work on a plan to include in the package for how that comparative analysis will happen and how the data analysis can help mitigate bias. Hillard Heintze also suggested that adding headings to the DHR chart or some explanation would be helpful.

In response to the suggestions, Unit Order was revised to include language addressing the above concern. The following language was included,

"The Staff Services Senior Administrative Analyst shall record and compile the demographics of the candidates assigned to each Background Investigation Unit Investigator. The Supervising Sergeant of the Background Investigation Unit will be responsible for inputting the information into the Background Investigation Master Spreadsheet at the time the candidate is assigned to a Background Investigator.

The Staff Services Senior Administrative Analyst will generate a report showing the demographics of each candidate with each Investigators timeliness of their investigation and the investigator's hiring recommendations. This report will be presented at each quarterly Recruiting and Retention meeting to verify that every candidate is evaluated individually, while each Background Investigator is evaluated for fairness and transparency."

Headings to the Background Investigation master spreadsheet was also included in attachment #4 to clearly show what each category represents. In response to the BIU master spreadsheet chart, the data in the spreadsheet is not from DHR but directly from BIU staff as described above.