



Recommendation 85.4

Gabriel Martinez [Redacted]

Tue 1/5/2021 10:27 AM

[Redacted]

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

Dear Acting Captain Altorfer,

Our office has completed its review of the materials related to Recommendation 85.4 that were submitted to us as part of the collaborative reform process. This package focused on SFPD evaluating the effectiveness of its recruitment efforts. After reviewing the package and information provided by the Department, the California Department of Justice finds as follows:

Recommendation 85.4: The SFPD should explore approaches to measure or validate the effectiveness of their recruitment outreach and events. The SFPD could do a community satisfaction survey or conduct GIS analysis to see whether all communities have access to these events.

Response to 85.4: The SFPD Recruitment Unit implements three main strategies to measure the effectiveness of their recruitment and outreach events: (1) a candidate tracking sheet; (2) event summaries; and (3) various surveys. First, the tracking sheet follows an applicant over the course of their recruitment and hiring. Recruiters are assigned to engage each applicant and provide mentorship throughout the hiring process and troubleshoot any applicant issues.

Second, the Recruitment Unit also completes an event summary after each recruitment event. The summary includes event details, number of contacts and signups, costs, the number of officers that attended, and general feedback about the event. These summaries are used to determine whether the Recruitment Unit will participate in an event again and information from the summaries are compiled in the Year End Review Report. In 2019 SFPD attended 219 events, including 46 first-time events.

Third, SFPD conducts five surveys that are presented and discussed at quarterly SFPD/SF Department of Human Resources Hiring Committee Meetings. First, SFPD sends a survey to applicants halfway through the hiring process (the background investigation stage) asking applicants how they were exposed to SFPD, about their contacts with the Recruitment Unit, any test preparation sessions, and suggestions for improvement. Second, all recruits that are hired are sent a survey asking for similar information. Third, the Recruitment Unit emails a survey to every person that they receive contact information from at recruiting event. The survey asks about the event, their contact with the recruiter, and general feedback. Fourth, the Recruitment Unit surveys members of Police Employee Groups (e.g., the Women’s Action Committee, the Pride Alliance, and the Latin Police Officers Association) at an annual meeting regarding suggestions as well as for assistance at recruiting events. Fifth, the Recruitment Unit implemented a Community Ambassador Program to engage community leaders to assist in recruitment. The Ambassadors are sent a yearly survey regarding recruitment efforts.

The Recruitment Unit publishes a Year End Review Report, which has been formalized in Unit Order 20-02 (“Recruitment Unit - Year End Review Report,” issued August 1, 2020). The yearly review includes



[REDACTED]

an assessment of recruitment events and activities, applicant contacts, media advertising, and recruitment strategies. SFPD has also outlined short term and long term strategies for reaching recruitment and hiring goals in the yearly reports including: (1) expansion of recruitment efforts into previously unexplored geographic territory; (2) exploring new cultural/social venues for outreach; (3) advertising focusing on the contemporary workforce/generation's needs and interests by using updated social-media platforms; (4) developing a more robust "farm system" by expanding mentorship of young adults in college; and (5) rethinking benefits packages, work/life support (scheduling/childcare/professional development). SFPD includes GIS mapping of events in the report to analyze where SFPD has already recruited and to ensure that recruitment tools, such as hosted workout sessions, are happening in diverse locations.

Going forward, SFPD has recently received approval to hire Interview Now, a company that will help SFPD launch a text messaging platform for communicating with applicants. Through the platform, applicants are directed to provide information about how they were directed to SFPD (e.g., social media, print advertisement, referral). From this information, the Recruitment Unit can compare the costs of its various forms of advertisement with results and allocate resources toward the most successful and cost-effective recruiting efforts.

SFPD is also planning on hiring a marketing company to help create and produce video content, advertisements, and social media content. Similar to Interview Now, the marketing company would provide analytics allowing SFPD to target the most successful advertising placements and the most interested applicants with additional advertisements. Both the marketing company and Interview Now's analytic reports will also measure the effectiveness of recruitment and outreach events.

Based upon all of the above, the Department of Justice finds that SFPD is in substantial compliance with this recommendation. Please let us know if you have any questions or would like to discuss these further. Thank you.

CONFIDENTIALITY NOTICE: This communication with its contents may contain confidential and/or legally privileged information. It is solely for the use of the intended recipient(s). Unauthorized interception, review, use or disclosure is prohibited and may violate applicable laws including the Electronic Communications Privacy Act. If you are not the intended recipient, please contact the sender and destroy all copies of the communication.

Hillard Heintze File Review Recommendation # 85.4

Finding # 85

The SFPD's Recruitment Unit has implemented an active recruitment program focused on diversity and targeted recruiting throughout San Francisco but does not measure or validate the effectiveness of their outreach and events.

Recommendation # 85.4

The SFPD should explore approaches to measure or validate the effectiveness of their recruitment outreach and events. The SFPD could do a community satisfaction survey or conduct GIS analysis to see whether all communities have access to these events.

Recommendation Status

Complete Partially Complete In Progress
 Not Started No Assessment

Summary

All compliance measures are met.

The SFPD is committed to engaging an external company to measure the effectiveness of recruiting efforts. Currently, the department uses surveys, outreach to interest groups and internal review in an attempt to validate effectiveness. There is evidence the department considered using GIS information to assist in measuring effectiveness of its efforts. Current practices are sufficient but not optimal for measuring or validating the effectiveness of the department's recruiting effort.

Compliance Measures

Status/Measure Met

Compliance Measures	Status/Measure Met
1 Plan measure effectiveness of recruitment outreach and events.	✓ Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/> N/A
2 Survey or engagement with communities to identify recruiting efforts.	✓ Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/> N/A
3 Review of GIS analysis as an option.	✓ Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/> N/A
4 Evidence of review and analysis of recruitment outreach.	✓ Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/> N/A
5 Continuous improvement loop – indicative of analysis and response.	✓ Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/> N/A

Administrative Issues

Compliance Issues



Collaborative Reform Completion Memorandum

Finding # 85: The SFPD's Recruitment Unit has implemented an active recruitment program focused on diversity and targeted recruiting throughout San Francisco but does not measure or validate the effectiveness of their outreach and events.

Recommendation # 85.4 The SFPD should explore approaches to measure or validate the effectiveness of their recruitment outreach and events. The SFPD could do a community satisfaction survey or conduct GIS analysis to see whether all communities have access to these events.

Response Date: 08/25/2020

Executive Summary: Currently the RU measures its effectiveness by utilizing a Tracking Sheet to track candidates through the hiring process, completing Event Summaries, collecting numerous surveys and completing a Year End Review Report. The future plan for improvement is to utilize a Text Messaging Platform and hire a Marketing Company. Read below for details related to each part of the plan.

Compliance Measures:

"For Recommendation 85.4, (The SFPD should explore approaches to measure or validate the effectiveness of their recruitment outreach and events. The SFPD could do a community satisfaction survey or conduct GIS analysis to see whether all communities have access to these events), SFPD agreed to expand on its description in the Form 2001 of the benefits of the analytic reports it anticipates getting from the proposed text message and branding programs and how the reports will inform recruitment efforts. SFPD explained that some of the data it gathers is limited for looking at trends, but assured that it looks at the Department of Human Resource data at monthly meetings to identify and address any problematic trends (e.g., recruits dropping out at a particular stage). SFPD will also provide more detail about how GIS information is used for analyzing recruitment event locations."

1. Plan measure effectiveness of recruitment outreach and events.

The RU's plan to measure its effectiveness is to continue utilizing a Tracking Sheet to track candidates, continue completing Event Summaries, continue collecting numerous surveys and continue to complete a Year End Review Report. The future plan for improvement is to utilize a Text Messaging Platform. We selected a company called Interview Now and got approval to work with them. Just as we started using the Text Messaging Platform, the SF Mayor initiated a hiring freeze for the SFPD. We have not been able to continue using this platform but we intend on moving forward with this company again as soon as the hiring freeze is lifted. The other part of our future plan is to hire a Marketing Company. We selected a company called Epic Productions and got approval to start initial branding work with them but COVID-19 restrictions and the hiring



Collaborative Reform Completion Memorandum

freeze have prevented us from starting this work. Our intention is to still move forward towards working with a Marketing Company when we are able to.

The RU Tracking Sheet is the first way effectiveness is measured

All RU efforts related to applicant hiring success, take a minimum of six months to a year to assess. This is typically how long it takes an applicant to make it through the testing process. This calls for long term tracking. The Recruitment Unit is tasked with tracking all interested applicants and candidates who are currently in the hiring process. Tracking information includes: name, ethnicity, gender, age, address, phone number, email address, school and the event location and date of contact. If the candidate is in the hiring process, their testing results also collected (application, written test, physical abilities test, oral board interview). Individual recruiters are assigned follow-ups with each applicant to engage them throughout the process. The recruiters provide assistance and mentorship. Currently the candidate's information is contained on a shared Tracking Sheet on SFPD's One-Drive Office 365 server.

As of 2/10/20, DHR is now providing all applicant contact information to the RU for tracking, mentorship and test prep help. The RU is tracking more interested candidates than ever before.

See **Attachment 1** blank Tracking Sheet Sample and redacted Tracking Sheet Sample

RU Event Summaries is the next way effectiveness is measured

After a RU member attends an event, they complete an Event Summary. The completed Event Summary is submitted to the RU Sergeant for review. Once reviewed, the Sergeant signs the bottom of the form and it is scanned into the Staff Services-Recruitment shared desktop folder for future reference. The Event Summaries are used to complete a RU Year End Review Report. The Event Summaries are often reviewed for past event information. The RU's supervisors (Staff Services Lieutenant, Staff Services Captain, Administration Bureau Commander and Administration Bureau Deputy Chief) often ask for the RU to review previous Event Summaries before they decide to approve the RU's attendance at an event again.

See **Attachment 2** Blank Event Summary

See **Attachment 3** 2019 Year End Review Report

Numerous Surveys is the next way effectiveness is measured

Please see Compliance Measure #2 below for survey information.

RU Year End Review Report is another way effectiveness is measured



Collaborative Reform Completion Memorandum

Each year the RU completes a Year End Review Report. Once completed, a printed copy is distributed to each member of the RU, the RU Sergeant, the Staff Services Lieutenant, the Staff Services Captain, the Administration Bureau Commander and the Administration Bureau Deputy Chief. Those listed members keep their printed copy on file and are also provided a digital version if requested. Numerous copies of the report are kept in the RU's office area and provided to Command Staff upon request. The report is stored in the Staff Services-Recruitment shared desktop folder. Copies of the report are also provided to the quarterly Hiring Committee Meeting members.

See **Attachment 3** 2019 Year End Review Report

Plan for future improvements to how RU measures its effectiveness

The RU hired a company called Interview Now to provide a text messaging platform to communicate with applicants. Every applicant that chooses to communicate through the text messaging platform is automatically directed to provide information regarding how they were directed to the SFPD. Examples are: social media, billboard advertisement, bus advertisement, magazine advertisement, referral from a friend, a recruitment event. The applicant is also asked to be even more specific. For example, specify which social media outlet, or which magazine or which recruiting event. The applicant also indicates which job posting they are interested in (Police, Intern, Cadet, etc.). The members from the SFPD Recruitment Unit have the ability to log in the costs associated with each advertising placement and each recruiting event. One of the most significant benefits of this new platform would be the analytic reports generated from the above listed data. The analytical reports and the subsequent review of them would allow the RU to specifically identify which advertising placements generated the most interest from and which ones were the most cost effective. The reports would also identify which events generate the most interest and which ones were the most cost effective.

The RU is also in the process of hiring a company to create an expansive marketing plan for the SFPD to assist in our recruitment outreach. This will include creating and producing video content, outdoor advertisements, social media content, etc. This company will strategically place all creative content to reach our targeted audiences. After content placement, this company will provide the RU with analytic reports. The analytical reports will include very detailed information related to the RU's online and social media presence. It will identify which social media platforms are the most successful for locating applicants and interacting with them. It will also identify which advertising placements are the most successful. These types of reports will allow the RU to retarget the most interested/invested applicants with additional advertisements. The review of these reports will also allow the RU to be more selective and cost effective when choosing advertising and recruiting locations.



Collaborative Reform Completion Memorandum

Both of these company's analytical reports will measure the effectiveness of recruitment outreach and events. This will improve the RU's selection of outreach and events. It will also allow for a quicker selection time regarding recruitment outreach and events.

2. Survey or engagement with communities to identify recruiting efforts.

The five surveys listed below are collected on an ongoing basis. They are reviewed by the RU and forwarded to supervisors through the chain of command. When each survey/report is completed it is presented at the next scheduled quarterly SFPD/DHR Hiring Committee Meeting. All members present at the meeting are provided with a copy and members who were invited but did not attend are sent a digital copy.

- The RU continues to collect the, "How Did You Hear About Us?" surveys. The Background Investigation Unit includes this survey when sending out their background packet information to applicants that have reached that stage in the hiring process. These are people who are approximately half way through the hiring process and they represent a wide range of diverse communities. The survey asks for the person to identify where or how they initially were exposed to the SFPD, if they had any contact with the RU specifically, if they attended any of the RU's test prep sessions, suggestions for other RU events and general suggestions. When the applicant mails in their survey it is forwarded to the RU. The RU reviews the information and generates survey reports.
- Since 11/21/18, the RU surveys all recruits when hired for the San Francisco Police Academy by using SurveyMonkey. A link is sent to them by email and each recruit is required to complete the survey. These people have made it through a long and selective hiring process. They represent the most qualified and successful applicants. They also represent a wide range of diverse communities. These surveys collect information related to where they were recruited from, background information, education, exposure to SFPD recruitment advertisements, exposure to RU members, access to test prep sessions, experience during the hiring process, general feedback and suggestions. The RU prints the completed survey report and reviews it.
- As of 08/16/19, a General Feedback survey is sent to every person the RU makes contact with at a recruiting event. A SurveyMonkey link is sent to their email. The survey collects information related to the event where they made contact with the RU, their initial perception of the RU staff, their satisfaction regarding the time and attention provided to them, what other events they suggest for the RU to attend, information regarding the RU test prep sessions and general feedback. The RU prints the completed survey report and reviews it.



Collaborative Reform Completion Memorandum

- RU meets with the Police Employee Groups (PEG groups) yearly to elicit suggestions, recommendations and assistance in recruiting outreach and events. The PEG groups represent and serve not only police officers but they also represent and serve many different communities in San Francisco and the Bay Area. At the beginning of 2019 the RU met with the PEG groups individually. A summary of those meetings was generated. At the beginning of 2020 the RU met with the PEG groups for a single group meeting. The 2020 meeting began with a review of the 2019 meeting summary and the RU presented which suggestions from the previous year had been implemented. New suggestions were collected and documented in the 2020 PEG group meeting minutes.
- Based on DOJ Recommendation 85.3, the SFPD RU has implemented a Recruitment Community Ambassador Program. This program is design to identify community leaders who are willing to assist in SFPDs recruitment efforts. One component of this program is a yearly survey of the community members who participate in the program. This survey allows the RU to elicit feedback and suggestions from community members regarding recruitment efforts. It also encourages the community members to assist in recruitment efforts.

See Attachment 4 "How Did You Hear About Us Survey?"

See Attachment 5 Class #270th, #271st and #272nd

See Attachment 6 General Feedback Survey

See Attachment 7 PEG group meeting summaries for 2019 and 2020

See Attachment 8 Recruitment Community Ambassador Program survey

3. Review of GIS analysis as an option

Each year the RU completes a Year End Review Report. This report includes information about the members who work on recruitment efforts, the events the RU attended, the contacts the RU made, the test prep sessions, advertising, etc. A section of the Year End Review Report includes GIS mapping. When the Year End Review Report is distributed and reviewed, RU members and their supervisors are encouraged to provide feedback and suggestions related to the previous year's efforts and the selection of recruitment locations.

Below are a few examples of ways the RU has reviewed/analyzed GIS maps:

- These maps can assist supervisors in identifying trends. For instance, recruiting numerous times at the same location or identifying locations the RU has not recruited at before. (One year a supervisor saw recruitment occurring numerous times at the same locations. A further review determined that the locations were



Collaborative Reform Completion Memorandum

consistent job fairs at various SF City College campuses. The supervisor determined these events were important for local recruitment efforts and instructed the RU to continue attending.)

- When the RU wanted to expand the locations where it hosted workout sessions, these maps were a reference tool to ensure a diverse location selection.
- When the SFPD Media Relations Unit has received public information requests regarding recruitment activities, these maps have served as a reference tool to provide a complete response.
- When other police agencies have requested SFPD recruitment information, the Year End Review along with these maps have been provided as a reference tool to help assess where they might consider recruiting.
- When other city agencies have requested SFPD recruitment information, these maps have served as a reference tool to help prepare presentations.

See **Attachment 3** 2019 Recruitment Unit Year End Review Report (GIS Mapping located on pages 16-17)

4. Evidence of review and analysis of recruitment outreach

Tracking Sheet

The RU Supervisors review the Tracking Sheet periodically to ensure entries are up to date and applicants are receiving frequent contact with their assigned recruiter. The RU Sergeant conducted a Tracking Sheet audit at the beginning of May 2020. After the audit, the Sergeant instructed SFPD Recruiters to contact applicants that were ready for additional outreach and follow-up.

See **Attachment 9** Emails from RU Sergeant to SFPD recruiters directing them to conduct additional applicant outreach and follow-up and to also update the Tracking Sheet

Event Summaries

Listed below are a few examples of the RU reviewing previous Event Summary's to determine whether or not to attend again or make adjustments.

- The Event Summary Form for the Professional Women Returning to Work Career Fair on 8/13/19 provided the following feedback: "I do not recommend to attend this event again....."
- The RU received invitations to attend that same event was on 10/9/19 and on 3/20/20. Based on the previous Event Summary recommendation the RU did not attend those events.



Collaborative Reform Completion Memorandum

- The Event Summary Form for the SF Auto Show 11/20/18-11/25/18 provided the following feedback: "The booth was not staffed on Thursday, November 22-23." The future recommendations: "The Recruitment booth needs to be staffed during the event hours."
- The Event Summary Form for the SF Auto Show 11/27/19-12/2/19 shows that SFPD staffed the recruitment booth all of the event days 11/28/19-12/1/19 based on the previous recommendation.

See **Attachment 10** Event Summary Form-Professional Women Returning to Work Career Fair, two advertisements for future Professional Women Returning to Work Career Fairs, Event Summaries for the 2018 SF Auto Show and the 2019 SF Auto Show

Surveys

As each survey is collected it is presented at the next scheduled SFPD/DHR Hiring Committee Meeting. Evidence of review of survey information can be found at the last Hiring Committee Meeting was held on 7/8/20. Academy Class #270th survey was presented and analyzed. Few suggestions were generated at that time due to the fact that hiring is currently frozen. It was noted that the Lateral Academy Class #271st and Academy Class #272nd were almost complete and would be presented at the next meeting.

See **Attachment 11** Minutes from 7/8/20 Hiring Committee Meeting (see bottom of page one and top of page two)

Year End Review

The 2019 Year End Review was completed and distributed to each member of the RU, the RU Sergeant, the Staff Services Lieutenant, the Staff Services Captain, the Administration Bureau Commander and the Administration Bureau Deputy Chief. The Year End Review is provided to and reviewed by internal SFPD Units or Bureau's upon request. It is also provided to and reviewed by outside agencies upon request.

Evidence of review, analysis and implementation of changes can be seen in the yearly report. One example: The college campus recruitment and out of area testing has proven to be effective and successful. Based on this, in 2019 the RU expanded its college campus recruitment and out of area testing compared to 2018. Please see 2018 Year End Review pages 12-14 which documents recruiting in Southern California and the Central Valley. Then, please see 2019 Year End Review pages 18-20 which documents recruiting expansion into Northern California colleges and out of state colleges.



Collaborative Reform Completion Memorandum

Second example: From 2018 to 2019 the RU updated its Event Summary Form. The new form included event type categories to better track the RU's diversity recruitment efforts. The category selections are: African American/Black, Asian, College, General, Hispanic/Latino, LGBTQ, Local, Military & Veteran, Other, Women, Youth. Please see the older version of the Event Summary in the 2018 Year End Review page 6. Then, please see the updated Event Summary in the 2019 Year End Review pages 9-10.

See **Attachment 12** 2018 Recruitment Unit Year End Review (pages 12-14 also 6)

See **Attachment 3** 2019 Recruitment Unit Year End Review Report (pages 18-20 also 9-10)

5. Continuous improvement loop-indicative of analysis and response

Tracking Sheet will continue to be updated by the RU Recruiters to ensure the data base is kept up to date. Effective tracking of applicants allows the RU to measure its outreach and events. The Sergeant in charge of the RU will periodically audit the Tracking Sheet to confirm accurate data entry and ensure all applicants are provided with continual communication and updates. Attachment 9 provides evidence of follow up communication between the RU Sergeant and the Recruiters after an audit.

Event Summaries are reviewed by the RU Supervisor and signed off on following each recruitment event. The event and the RU's success at the event is analyzed at that time and then again in the future if the RU is considering attending the same event in the future. Unit Order 17-04 provides directions for completing Event Summaries and a procedure to ensure they are saved for future review and assessment.

Surveys will be collect by the RU each year in order to measure or validate the effectiveness of the RU's outreach and events. The two survey that have very specific report requirements are the PEG Group meeting summaries and the Recruitment Community Ambassador survey. The PEG Group meeting summaries include a review, an assessment and any suggestions related to recruitment efforts. The Recruitment Community Ambassador survey will allow participants to provide feedback and insight related to recruitment efforts. Unit Order 20-02 outlines this police and procedure.

A Year End Review will be published at the beginning of each calendar year summarizing the previous year's efforts. This report will serve as a guide to develop the forthcoming year's recruitment strategy and will monitor and assess the progress and improvements made on an annual basis. A copy of the completed Year End Review will be distributed through the chain of command and made available for review in the Staff Services-Recruitment shared desktop folder. Unit Order 20-02 outlines this policy and procedure.