Recommendation 81.1

- McGuire, Catherine (POL);
- Scott, William (POL);
-

+8 others

Dear Acting Captain Altorfer:

Our office has completed its review of the materials related to Recommendation 81.1 that have been submitted to us as part of the collaborative reform process. After reviewing the package and information provided by the Department, the California Department of Justice finds as follows:

Recommendation 81.1: The SFPD should clearly articulate its hiring and background standards as matter of building community trust and ensuring applicants are prepared.

Response to Recommendation 81.1:

Though the City of San Francisco's Department of Human Resources largely oversees the hiring process, SFPD has nonetheless taken ownership of making sure that all of the Department's hiring and background standards are clearly articulated on its website.

SFPD has a webpage specifically focused on the hiring process. It includes clear links to (1) the salary and benefits; (2) the application process, including what the physical ability test and background investigation entail; (3) the selection procedures, and (4) the Basic Academy. SFPD also took into consideration feedback provided by the California Department of Justice and Hillard Heintze to add some language to the hiring webpage and to reorganize the layout to make information about hiring clearer for applicants. As one example of how SFPD clearly articulates its hiring process, SFPD includes videos on its website that detail each component of the physical ability test, which gives applicants insight on what to expect and how to prepare. SFPD also makes clear that, as part of the background investigation process, investigators will contact current and previous neighbors (where practicable) of an applicant. The detailed information on the hiring process helps applicants understand all of the stages and what is expected of them.

Based upon all of the above, the Department of Justice finds that SFPD is in substantial compliance with this recommendation. Please let us know if you have any questions or would like to discuss these further.

Please let us know if you have any questions or would like to discuss this further. Thank you.

Tanya

Tanya S. Koshy
Deputy Attorney General
Civil Rights Enforcement Section
California Department of Justice
1515 Clay Street, Suite 2100
Oakland, CA 94612

Collaborative Reform Completion Memorandum

Finding #81: Despite a relatively good record in hiring diverse candidates, perception remains in the community that the SFPD seeks to eliminate diverse candidates from it's hiring pool. A lack of community engagement perpetuates this perception over hiring requirements.

Recommendation #81.1: The SFPD should clearly articulate its hiring and background standards as matter of building community trust and ensuring applicants are prepared.

Response Date: 01/25/2021

Executive Summary:

The SFPD clearly articulates it's hiring and background standards in it's website: www.sanfranciscopolice.org.
DHR clearly articulates SFPD's hiring and background standards in it's website: https://jobapscloud.com/SF/sup/bulpreview.asp?R1=CCT&R2=Q002&R3=060667

Both websites are publicly available and accessible to the community. The information provided at these websites regarding the hiring and background standards is detailed and clear.

To continue to build community trust and to further support candidate preparation, the SFPD engages candidates in numerous recruitment activities and resources. The examples described below are: distributing recruitment flyers, social media posts, a mentorship program, written test prep help, physical test prep help, oral boards test prep help, remote recruitment efforts and a Background Investigation Unit presentation.

The SFPD commits to continuously reviewing its hiring and background standards. When changes are made to any portion of the hiring process, all recruitment material will be updated and redistributed or reposted. The SFPD will also conduct surveys to collect feedback regarding it's hiring and background standards, along with feedback regarding the type and quality of candidate preparation that is offered.

Compliance Measures:

1. Hiring and background standards publicly available and easily accessible to community.

The SFPD Recruitment Unit (RU) has a web address that links to the SFPD Career's homepage on the SFPD's website: www.SFPDcareers.com. This web address leads to https://www.sanfranciscopolice.org/your-sfpd/careers, which is the hub for all the career opportunities within the Police department. It clearly articulates the SFPD hiring and background standards for the Entry Level (Q-2) Police Officer's position, including these particular sections:

Collaborative Reform Completion Memorandum

- General Information and Qualifications
- Application and Selection Procedures
- Physical Ability Test (includes a video displaying testing components)
- Oral Examination
- Background Investigations

DHR has a section of their website specifically for information related to the SFPD Entry Level (Q-2) Police Officer's position:
https://jobapscloud.com/SF/sup/bulpreview.asp?R1=CCT&R2=Q002&R3=060667
It clearly articulates the SFPD hiring and background standards for the Entry Level (Q-2) Police Officer's position, including these particular sections:

- Eligibility Requirements: Citizenship, Age, Driver's License, Education, Judicial Record, Desirable Qualifications
- Application and Selection Procedures
- Step 1: First, complete and submit an online application with the City and County of San Francisco
- Step 2: Next, schedule yourself to take the "FrontLine National" law enforcement examination administered by the National Testing Network (NTN)
- Step 3: Candidates that attain passing scores on the FrontLine National examination will be invited to take the Physical Ability Test (PAT) and Oral Interview.
- The Physical Ability Test (PAT)
- The Oral Interview
- Eligible List / Certification Rule
- Personal History Questionnaire (PHQ) Evaluation
- Employment, Character, and Background Investigation
- Review of Judicial and Driving Records
- Polygraph Examination
- Testing for Use of Controlled Substances
- Psychological Examination
- Medical Examination
- Vision Testing
- Hearing Testing

On Monday, December 28, 2020, SFPD Professional Standards members participated in a conference call with members of Hillard Heintze and the California Department of Justice. During the prescreening, suggestions and guidelines were discussed for this recommendation as described below in italics and quotations in Compliance Measure 1, *Compliance Measure 2 and Compliance Measure 4.*

Collaborative Reform Completion Memorandum

"Cal DOJ and Hillard Heintze noted that SFPD's website does not make its application/hiring steps readily accessible. Specifically, a person would have to scroll past the recruitment video all the way to the bottom of the Sworn Job Openings page in order to find out more information about the application and hiring process. A potential applicant may not realize that there is additional information beneath the recruitment video and therefore would miss that additional information. Cal DOJ suggested adding buttons next to the "APPLY NOW TO BECOME A POLICE OFFICER" button for information about the application, hiring process, salary, benefits, etc. Hillard Heintze also suggested renaming the button entitled "APPLY NOW TO BECOME A POLICE OFFICER" to something else, like 'for further information on applying' because a person cannot apply directly to the agency by clicking on that button."

In response to these suggestions, the SFPD relocated their application and hiring steps listed in the website above the recruitment video to be more prominently displayed. At this time the SFPD will keep the button named "APPLY NOW TO BECOME A POLICE OFFICER" This ensures that interested applicants who click on the link will be sent directly to DHRs Q-2 Police Officer application.

"Hillard Heintze also thought that SFPD could provide additional information on their website about what the background investigation process entails. Specifically, SFPD could explain that, as part of the background investigation, SFPD will conduct a credit check, that it may talk to an applicant's neighbors, etc."

The SFPD Background Investigations website section includes in it's opening paragraph that applicant credit history will be reviewed. To address the second request, this language has been added to the website "Background Investigators will contact current and, where practicable, previous neighbors to determine whether the candidate has exhibited behavior incompatible with the position sought."

https://www.sanfranciscopolice.org/your-sfpd/careers/sworn-job-openings/background-investigations

2. Hiring and background standards detailed in a clear manner.

The hiring and background standards listed on the SFPD website and on the DHR website were identified in CM #1. Each section contains clear and detailed information explaining the steps and requirements involved in the hiring process. Please see Attachment #18 for the detailed sections from both websites.

See Attachment #18 SFPD and DHR Websites Hiring Standard Details

"Cal DOJ and Hillard Heintze noted that SFPD copied and pasted the text of their webpages on hiring into the body of the Form 2001. Rather than do that (since it takes up roughly ten pages), Cal DOJ asked that SFPD simply print the webpages and include them as an attachment. In the body of the Form 2001, SFPD can just refer to the attachment for further details."

CM #1 has been updated to comply with this suggestion. Please see above response and attachment #18.

3. Evidence of activities and resources (e.g., pamphlets, social media outreach, etc.) to support candidate preparation.

SFPD Flyer-The SFPD has a recruitment flyer that is distributed to interested candidates at all recruiting events, i.e. job fairs, community events, school presentations and they are readily available near the front counter of all 10 district stations including the SFO Airport Bureau. The flyer clearly articulates SFPD's minimum qualifications and testing steps:

Entry Level (Q-2) Police Officer
Minimum Qualifications:
- Be 21 years of age.
- There is no maximum age limit.
- Have not been convicted of a felony crime.
- Have not been convicted of an offense involving domestic violence.
- Have not been convicted of any misdemeanor, which carries a penalty of prohibiting ownership, possession or control of a firearm.
- Be a U.S. citizen.
- Have a U.S. High School Diploma, have passed a G.E.D. or the California High School Proficiency Examination, or have an AA or higher degree from an accredited college or university.
- Have a valid driver's license to operate an automobile.

The Police Officer Testing Components:
- A written examination will test 3 components: Written language ability, reading ability and video-based human relations-test.
- A physical ability examination that measures strength, endurance, equilibrium and flexibility.
- An oral interview that tests oral communication, problem solving and interpersonal skills.
- Candidates who pass the three part Police Officer examination process move on to the Background Investigation process. The Background Investigation process consists of:
  - Personal History Questionnaire (PHQ) Evaluation
  - Employment, Character and Background Investigation
  - Review of Judicial and Driving Records
  - Polygraph Examination
  - Testing for Use of Controlled Substances
  - Psychological Examination

Collaborative Reform Completion Memorandum

- Medical Examination that includes a vision test, a hearing test and height/weight measurements.

See <mark>Attachment #1</mark> Recruitment Flyer

Social Media-The RU regularly posts on its social media platforms in an effort to support candidate preparation. The posts are often general information directing candidates to call or email the RU so that all questions can be answered. The posts also include information *encouraging candidates to attend SFPD test prep help sessions.*

See <mark>Attachment #2</mark> Screenshots of Social Media Posts

Mentorship-The SFPD provides a "high touch" mentorship approach to support candidate preparation. This means that the SFPD is committed to assisting our applicants on a personal level through all stages of the hiring process and utilizes the entire RU team to maintain direct, and frequent contact with applicants. DHR currently provides the RU access to all applicant contact information. The SFPD RU offers mentorship through emails and phone calls to every applicant. During mentorship communications, the below test prep help is also offered to every applicant. The attached screenshot of the RU's tracking sheet shows "high touch" mentorship and communication with applicants.

See <mark>Attachment #3</mark> *Screenshot of Tracking List*

Written Test Prep Help-The RU provides written test prep help to support candidate preparation. The RU will provide a description of the written testing components and tips over *the phone. The following information we provide to applicants is consistent with NTN's online* information, which is accessible to every candidate via the internet for: https://nationaltestingnetwork.com/publicsafetyjobs/ntn-test-law.cfm

NTN Tests – FrontLine- Law Enforcement Testing

There are three components to the FrontLine Testing System: a video-based human relations test, a reading ability test and a report writing test. Testing takes approximately 2 hours.

FrontLine Video-Based Human Relations Test

FrontLine focuses on using good judgment in enforcement, public relations and teamwork. Candidates do not have to have experience in order to do well. Candidates watch a video segment and then choose the BEST course of action in a multiple-choice format. This test is presented on computer or video and the items play without stopping. Candidates have 10 seconds to answer each question.

PSPPB Form 2001 v2

Collaborative Reform Completion Memorandum

All information that may be needed to answer a question is provided in the test. Frontline is not designed to be a test of policy or technical components and candidates are asked to only know what is stated during the video.

FrontLine Reading Test

FrontLine Reading Test is designed specifically for law enforcement officers, a job requiring on-going study of difficult and technical materials. This test is based on typical training materials. Certain words are left blank. Candidates are required to choose a word that best fits in the blank. They are given 15 minutes to complete this test.

FrontLine Incident Observation and Report Writing Test

Report writing is an important part of a law enforcement officer's job. For this test candidates view a brief incident presented on video. They are given blank pieces of paper for notes and a draft, then asked to write a report on the answer sheet in the space provided. They are shown an example scenario and a sample of an excellent written report. After viewing the video twice, they are given 10 minutes to complete the report.

The RU also directs applicants to NTN's online practice test: https://ergopracticetests.com/?FLB/

FrontLine Practice Test

For more detailed information and practice items with discussion, visit the FrontLine Practice Test website at www.frontlinetest.com. This site allows you to interactively review seven example video test items, with a discussion of the possible answer choices. The site also has a 21 item practice reading test.

So that applicants don't have to put off testing due to a financial hardship and to also help support candidate preparation, fee waiver options are available. DHR provides a fee waiver program for applicants who need financial assistance with the $49 written test fee. The RU has coordinated with DHR an additional event based voucher program to waive the written test fee when the RU is conducting testing remotely.

Physical Test Prep Help-The RU provides physical test prep help by providing monthly practice sessions. Attendees are able to practice all four PAT testing components with SFPD members who are certified to proctor the actual PAT. The practice equipment is set up to mirror the actual PAT test. The attendees are allowed to practice each component as many times as they want. The staff running the practice sessions provide suggestions for areas of improvement.

Collaborative Reform Completion Memorandum

The RU provides additional physical conditioning assistance by providing monthly workout sessions. These workout sessions are meant to prepare applicants for their upcoming PAT test but also prepare them for the physical demands and expectations of the Police Academy. The staff guides the attendees through numerous cardio and strengthening circuits. The workouts are open to anyone in the hiring process and applicants can attend as many times as they want. The workout sessions are frequently moved around to various locations in San Francisco in an effort to bring the test prep help closer to the applicant's location.

See Attachment #4 Test Prep Calendar

Oral Board Test Prep Help-The RU provides oral board test prep help by providing monthly practice sessions. Both in person sessions and remote over the phone sessions are offered. The members of the RU host the practice sessions. The session begins with an introduction and then a description of what to expect on the test day. The attendees are asked to respond to mock test questions. The RU members provide the applicant with feedback based on their responses to the questions and also offer suggestions for improvement. Candidates are allowed to participate in as many practice sessions as they want to prior to testing. See the attached mock oral interview outline and mock questions.

See Attachment #4 Test Prep Calendar
See Attachment #5 Mock Oral Interview Outline and Mock Questions

Remote Recruitment Efforts-Numerous times throughout the year the RU provides and coordinates testing in various locations outside of San Francisco. This testing includes the NTN written test and the PAT. DHR also allows out of area applicants to take their Oral Boards Test virtually. This eliminates multiple, costly trips to San Francisco for out of area applicants. To support candidate preparedness, these applicants are also provided many of the test prep options listed above. They are offered the same NTN written test prep help listed above. They are offered in person PAT test prep help when the RU travels to their area. They are also offered in person or over the phone oral board test prep help.

See Attachment #6 DHR's Q-2 Police Officer Skype Interview Agreement

Backgrounds Investigation Unit-The SFPD Background Investigation Unit also does numerous things to support candidate preparation. The most notable being a presentation provided to all candidates after the PAT test. This presentation is provided to prepare candidates for the Background process they will be entering if they pass the PAT. This presentation begins with an introduction and then includes the CA POST mandated forms along with the SFPD mandated forms which are necessary to initiate each candidates Background Investigation. During the presentation, the CA POST Personal History Statement (PHS) is displayed on a screen and the Background Investigators who are presenting go over

PSPPB Form 2001 v2

each section in great detail. They explain how to complete the PHS and they review common mistakes or omissions.

Next, the SFPD Background Packet is displayed on the screen and the Background Investigators who are presenting go over each form. The very first page lists instructions for completing all of the forms contained within the Background Packet and a list of the documents they must begin to collect or request. The candidates are provided instructions on how to submit their Background Packets and they are provided with a prepaid postage, self-addressed, 9" x 12" envelope to mail in their packet. Lastly, they discuss the online Personal History Questionnaire (PHQ). They are given detailed verbal instructions and also handed a copy of these instructions.

Q & A is welcomed at any time during the presentation and one-on-one Q & A is offered after the presentation. All verbal instructions, all form provided and the ending of the presentation on the screen direct attendees to the Background Investigation Unit main phone line and email address for any questions.

See Attachment #7 The CA POST Personal History Statement (25 pages)
See Attachment #8 The SFPD Background Packet (17 forms)
See Attachment #9 Q-2 Peace Officer Candidate E-130

4. Ongoing review and continuous improvement loop established.
The SFPD continuously reviews it's hiring standards and frequently considers changes or improvements. Anytime there is a change, the SFPD ensures that all information related to the change is made publicly available by updating the recruitment flyers and online content.

When an update is made to the flyers, the RU personally goes to all 10 district stations and the Airport Bureau to disseminate the new flyers and dispose of the outdated flyers. Examples of updated changes would be a wage increase, the Chief of Police changed or when the recruitment message changed. Please see attachment #1 for the most current recruitment flyer and then compare it the attachment #10 which shows examples of outdated recruitment flyers.

The SFPD website's recruitment information is also updated when there are changes. Examples of changes would be updating the recruitment message, the RU contact information and wage increases. Please see the attached emails which show communication between the RU and the Media Relations Unit requesting changes and updates to the website content.

Attachment #11 is an email chain from Recruiter Luciana Ng to Director David Stevenson, providing an updated recruitment message and requesting to update the RU contact information and difficult to read content.

Collaborative Reform Completion Memorandum

Attachment #12 is an email chain from Recruiter Luciana Ng to Sergeant Jennifer Nguyen requesting to update the salary information, incorrect links, correct the RU contact information and add a new recruitment video.

Attachment #13 is a packet that the RU put together, providing suggested updates and mandatory updates for the new website. This was put together before the release of the new website in 2019 so that the most up to date and accurate content would be included when the website went live. This packet was sent from Sergeant Christina Serrano and Recruiter Luciana Ng to SFPD Web Services & Creative Lead Denise Debrunner in March of 2019.

See Attachment #1 Recruitment Flyer
See Attachment #10 Previous Recruitment Flyers
See Attachment #11 Email Requesting Website Update (3 pages)
See Attachment #12 Email Requesting Website Update (5pages)
See Attachment #13 New Website Update Packet

The SFPD RU collects surveys throughout each year in an effort to gather information that can be used to improve our department. One survey specifically gathers candidates' opinions and experiences during the hiring process. Attachment #14 is the Academy Class #272 survey. This survey is collected for each group of recruits entering a new academy class. It has been reviewed by the RU and Staff Services/Administration Bureau Supervisors immediately after being collected and was reviewed at the 7/8/20 SFPD/DHR Quarterly Hiring Committee Meeting.

The second survey is sent to applicants who attend any of the RU's test prep help sessions. As stated in CM #3, the RU test prep help is offered to all applicants in order to support candidate preparedness. This survey asks for the candidates to give feedback about the quality of assistance they were provided and to provide suggestions for improvement. Attachment #15 is a recent survey of applicants who took advantage of one or more test prep help sessions. It has been reviewed by the RU and Staff Services/Administration Bureau Supervisors immediately after being collected and will be reviewed again at the next scheduled SFPD/DHR Quarterly Hiring Committee Meeting in January 2021.

See Attachment #14 Academy Class #272 Survey
See Attachment #15 Test Prep Help Survey

The SFPD/DHR Quarterly Hiring Committee Meetings is the regularly scheduled forum where the departments hiring standards are reviewed and changes are discussed. Attachment 16 includes the minutes from meetings on 10-15-20 and 7-8-20 meeting minutes. Please review these attachments to see examples of discussion topics that include:
- The NTN written test
- The PAT test
- Reviewing handgrip passage rates from the PAT
- Consideration to remove PAT test for lateral applicants

PSPPB Form 2001 v2

- The fee waiver process
- DHR testing schedules
- SFPD test prep help
- Background packet information
- Review of Academy Surveys #270th, #271st and #272nd
- Drug policy review and discussions related to maintaining confidentiality
- Marijuana usage by applicants

Attachment #17 is Unit Order #17-05 which established the SFPD/DHR Quarterly Hiring Committee Meetings and ensures they will continue to be held.

See Attachment #16 Meeting Minutes
See Attachment #17 Unit Order #17-05

"Finally, Cal DOJ suggested that the Recruitment Unit Survey referenced in Compliance Measure 4 could specifically ask recruits if they were exposed to the website and if so, whether the website clearly explained the hiring and background standards and whether the recruits had feedback on how that explanation could be improved."

The RU has updated its survey. Asking about website exposure is now a separate question after the general advertising exposure options in question #14. Additionally, if you indicate that you were exposed to the careers section of the website in questions #15, you are directed to question #16, "were the hiring and background standards publicly available and easily accessible?" You are also asked to provide specific feedback.

See Attachment #19 Updated Survey Questions Screenshot (questions 14, 15 and 16)