

[REDACTED]

From: Gabriel Martinez [REDACTED]
Sent: Thursday, July 1, 2021 11:49 AM
To: [REDACTED]
Subject: Recommendation 27.3

[REDACTED] [REDACTED]

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

Dear Acting Captain Altorfer,

Our office has completed its review of the materials related to Recommendation 27.3 that were submitted to us as part of the collaborative reform process. This package focused on SFPD incorporating interactive trainings for their bias-related trainings. After reviewing the package and information provided by the Department, the California Department of Justice finds as follows:

Recommendation 27.3: Training addressing explicit and implicit biases should employ teaching methodologies that implement interactive adult learning concepts rather than straight lecture-based training and delivery.

Response to 27.3: SFPD has incorporated interactive adult learning into its bias courses by ensuring trainers are trained in adult-learning concepts and by creating interactive curriculum in its courses. SFPD has worked with trainers to ensure they are trained in adult learning by certifying all academy lead instructors in the Academy Instructor Certification Course, which includes training sections on active involvement of students when instructing. Additionally, the Principled Policing/Procedural Justice and Implicit Bias training instructors were required to attend a train-the-trainer course. The course included input from the California Police Officers Standards and Training (POST) and Stanford University SPARQ (Social Psychological Answers to Real-world Questions) and included adult-learning instructing sections.

SFPD has incorporated the adult-learning methods into its bias-related courses. The Principled Policing and Bias courses incorporate visual, auditory, and interactive learning through PowerPoint presentations, videos, pictures, written content, lecture, group work, discussion, and student presentations. For example, in the Principled Policing course, instead of lecturing about the impacts of labeling, officers are placed in groups to discuss, write, and then present to the group on labels used by the police and by the community and the consequences of those labels. And in Department of Human Resources bias trainings, officers play a Jeopardy-

style game that includes categories on gender, sexual orientation, race, religion, and disability. Officers discuss the answers and instructors encourage sharing examples from officers' experiences.

In addition to the above methods, SFPD incorporates real-world scenarios for officers in the Crisis Intervention Training. This provides officers with the opportunity to implement and practice the training they receive. After being trained, officers are called to pretend scenes and the officers are confronted with role players in crisis situations. The officers must respond to the situation and the role players respond to the tactics the officers use. The group then debriefs to discuss areas for improvement.

Based upon all of the above, the Department of Justice finds that SFPD is in substantial compliance with this recommendation. Please let us know if you have any questions or would like to discuss further. Thank you.

CONFIDENTIALITY NOTICE: This communication with its contents may contain confidential and/or legally privileged information. It is solely for the use of the intended recipient(s). Unauthorized interception, review, use or disclosure is prohibited and may violate applicable laws including the Electronic Communications Privacy Act. If you are not the intended recipient, please contact the sender and destroy all copies of the communication.

Finding # 27	The SFPD is not addressing the anti-bias goals set forth through the Fair and Impartial Policing training-the-trainers session.
Recommendation # 27.3	Training addressing explicit and implicit biases should employ teaching methodologies that implement interactive adult learning concepts rather than straight lecture-based training delivery.

Recommendation Status	Complete	Partially Complete	In Progress
	Not Started	No Assessment	

Summary

The San Francisco Police Department has developed interactive training models to deliver explicit and implicit bias training. Crisis Intervention and Critical Mindset are examples of interactive training that rely on the active participation of members rather than lecture based training. The education content was developed with the assistance of leading academic and industry researchers.

The department has developed procedures for measuring the near-term effectiveness of training and will seek professional guidance in evaluating the long term effectiveness of anti-bias education and training.

The review team recommends changing the name of "Shoot-Don't Shoot" to "Force Options Scenario Based Training", so not to say that there is limitation for officers to those options only when other options may be available, for example, use of critical mindset training.

Compliance Measures		Status/Measure Met
1	Develop training with expert input on addressing explicit and implicit biases that uses adult teaching methodologies.	√ Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/> N/A
2	Training uses interactive adult learning concepts.	√ Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/> N/A
3	Training delivery not solely lecture based.	√ Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/> N/A
4	Continuous improvement loop.	√ Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/> N/A

Administrative Issues

Compliance Issues



Collaborative Reform Completion Memorandum

Finding # 27: The SFPD is not addressing the anti-bias goals set forth through the Fair and Impartial Policing training-the-trainers session.

Recommendation # 27.3 Training addressing explicit and implicit biases should employ teaching methodologies that implement interactive adult learning concepts rather than straight lecture-based training and delivery.

Response Date: December 20, 2020

Executive Summary:

Since the Department of Justice (DOJ) recommendation was received in 2016, the San Francisco Police Department (SFPD) has continued to evolve in order to create new course curriculum to achieve its anti-bias goals. The SFPD requires that all members take continuous training in procedural justice, bias, cultural competency and fair and impartial policing. All supervisory members were trained first. This was followed by all officers, PSAs, and executive staff who were trained during their Advanced Officer and Continued Professional Training sessions. These mandatory courses, have also been presented in collaboration with the Department of Human Resources and provided by the SFPD Academy Training Division. The initial training requirements were completed by December 2018. However, the SFPD continues to provide this training to all members, including new recruits during their academy training. (See Attachment # 5: Bias Training Audit Report)

The San Francisco Police Department began training Principled Policing in 2017. This training introduces the concept of procedural justice and how it strengthens the relationship of trust between police and communities, and presents the concept of implicit bias. The most important aspects of procedural justice are giving people the opportunity to tell their side of the story, remaining neutral in decision making and behavior, treating people with respect, and explaining actions in a way that communicates caring for people's concerns to demonstrate trustworthiness. One significant threat to procedural justice is implicit bias - thoughts and feelings about social groups that can influence perceptions, decisions, and actions. The course uses the research conducted by Dr. Tom Tyler (Yale Law School) & Tracy Mears (Yale Law School) on Procedural Fairness, and Dr. Jennifer Eberhardt (Department of Psychology Stanford University, Stanford, CA) & Dr. Lorie Fridell's (Professor of Criminology, University of South Florida) Implicit Bias studies. The training is an 8 hour session that is taught by a selected core of San Francisco Police Department personnel. SFPD sergeants and officers were sent to the Train-the-Trainer courses to deliver the Principled Policing training with expert input that uses adult teaching methodologies.



Collaborative Reform Completion Memorandum

Compliance Measures:

- 1) Develop training with expert input on addressing explicit and implicit biases that uses adult teaching methodologies.**

Since 2000, the San Francisco Police Academy put into practice the standard of adult-based learning as put forth by The California Police Officers Standard and Training Commission. The standard consists of in-classroom activities, class participation and instructor facilitated discussions. Academy instructors also employ:

- The Socratic Method: The Socratic method is a form of cooperative argumentative dialogue between individuals, based on asking and answering questions to stimulate critical thinking and to draw out ideas and underlying presuppositions.
- Facilitating collaborative dialogue between students
- Encouraging students to ask and answer class questions using their own life experiences and prior training.

Further, the practice of RIDEM (Relevance, Involvement, Discovery, Experience, and Modeling) is used with the following steps, which include all three adult learning methodologies (auditory, visual and kinesthetic):

- Tell them what you are going to teach them (auditory)
- Teach them (visual and kinesthetic)
- Tell them what you taught them (auditory)
- Test them (kinesthetic)

All Academy lead instructors are AICC (Academy Instructor Certification Course,) certified. (See attachment 1: AICC Course Outline)

The AICC training in which students internalize new skills, knowledge, and attitudes requires instructor attention to key concepts and methodologies.

1. Failing Forward – Are students given the opportunity to learn from failure?
2. Assessment – Are students given the opportunity to assess their own and others' performance?
3. Active involvement – Are students actively involved in their learning?
4. Context – Are students clear of the context of what is to be learned to allow for transference to occur?
5. Modeling – Are students able to model the knowledge, skills, and attitudes they wish to see in their own classes?
6. Questions – Are students able to ask questions to cause thinking?



Collaborative Reform Completion Memorandum

7. Real World – Does the opportunity for transference to the real world exist within a training?
8. Identity – Does the student understand their role and orientation with regard to what is to be learned?
9. Resistive Students – Does the student have strategies for dealing with difficult classroom experiences?

Additionally, all the Principled Policing/Procedural Justice and Implicit Bias instructors were required to attend a POST certified Train-The-Trainer course. The California Department of Justice, California Police Officers Standards and Training, and Stanford University SPARQ (Social Psychological Answers to Real-world Questions) conducted multiple three and four-day (24-32 hour) POST certified Principled Policing Train-the-Trainer courses.

These mandatory courses provided a “how to” on teaching policy approaches that emphasize respect, listening, neutrality, and trust (Procedural Justice) while also addressing the common implicit biases that can be barriers to these approaches (Implicit Bias). Law enforcement agencies can improve trust and relationships with their communities by using these principles to evaluate their departments’ policies, procedures, and training. This course prepared law enforcement agencies to teach the one-day (8-hour) “Principled Policing: A Discussion of Procedural Justice & Implicit Bias” course with a focus on ensuring effective, high-quality training.

2) Training uses interactive adult learning concepts.

A. Principled Policing and Bias Training

Principled Policing and Bias training utilizes adult learning concepts during the eight-hour training course to ensure that information is properly presented and understood. Adult learning methods consists of three learning styles: visual, auditory, and interactive learning (kinesthetic).

Principled Policing and Bias training consist of a power point presentation that is displayed at the front of the classroom for visual learners/learning. Each slide is presented to the class and explained. There are videos, pictures, and written content which covers all modules of training. For auditory learners/learning, the information from each slide is read aloud, verbally explained and/or discussed in class. Interactive



Collaborative Reform Completion Memorandum

learning (kinesthetic) includes participating in working groups to incorporate the information that had been presented and discussed.

There is group work which requires each member in the group to contribute and present their work to the class. Their presentations include written content on a work board which is placed inside the training room and remains posted for the entire day for reference and retention. The group has to verbally present their ideas to the class which promotes class discussions and group/individual interactive learning.

Each class is presented with 2-3 different instructors. Each instructor was selected by the academy staff to present principled policing and bias training based on their experience, work ethic and communication skills. The instructors facilitate each module to provide different points of view, experiences, and techniques that enable them to interact with members of the Department to ensure understanding of the material and concepts. Because the discussion of procedural justice and implicit biases can be a difficult conversation, having 2-3 instructors facilitate the training helps create open dialogue and provide a platform for individual experiences.

The current Principled Policing/Procedural Justice training class which addresses explicit and implicit bias awareness was taught to the department from 2016-2018. Currently, the Principled Policing/Procedural Justice training class is now a part of the Basic Academy Recruit Class curriculum being taught to all recruits. This class is designed in such a way that class participants have several opportunities to engage in interactive adult learning concepts.

Students participate in a **learning activity** that assesses the negative impact of labeling on the community and law enforcement. Students are broken up into groups of four and asked to write on a flip chart words used by the community to describe police, and secondly, write down words the police use to describe the community. A facilitated discussion follows on the power of negative labels and the effects on how the police provide service to the community. Thereafter, the discussion focuses on how law enforcement can impact their officers' descriptive terms of their community. Key discussion points from this activity that students engage in are:

- Labeling goes both ways
- Labeling makes it harder to be procedurally just because it changes the way we think about people; it dehumanizes
- Labeling reinforces the "us vs them" mentality

(See attachment #2: Principled Policing/Procedural Justice and Implicit Bias Course Outline)



Collaborative Reform Completion Memorandum

B. Department of Human Resources Training

Additionally, SFPD has partnered with the Department of Human Resources (DHR) to provide the following Bias related training (See attachment #3: **Creating an Inclusive Environment, DHR Training**):

- Creating an Inclusive Environment (2-Day Training)
- Managing Implicit Bias: Raising Awareness and Creating Inclusion (1-Day Training)

While attending the DHR classes, students participated in a game of Jeopardy that consisted of categories on topics of gender, sexual orientation, race, religion, and disability. Students were broken up into teams of 3 or 4 and discussed institutionalized and systematic inequalities pertaining to the Jeopardy category chosen by the group. By participating in this activity, the adult learning activity employed by the instructors consisted of:

- Facilitating collaborative dialogue between students
- Encouraging students to ask and answer class questions using their own life experiences and prior training.

3) Training delivery not solely lecture based.

During Pre-Screen on 12/28/2020 the following feedback was given:

"Cal DOJ and Hillard Heintze thought the package generally looked good. Cal DOJ noted that SFPD did a great job of incorporating its feedback and preparing a memo on its teaching methodologies. Cal DOJ asked that SFPD reference that memo in the narrative under Compliance Measure 3. Cal DOJ also noted that the unit order in Attachment 8 is missing a page."

The current Principled Policing/Procedural Justice and Implicit Bias training class which addresses explicit and implicit bias awareness was taught to the department members during the 2016-2018 Advance Officer/Continued Professional Development cycle. Currently, the Principled Policing/Procedural Justice training class is now a part of the Basic Academy Recruit Class curriculum being taught to all recruits. This class is designed in such a way that class participants have several opportunities to engage in interactive adult learning concepts such as:

- The Socratic Method
- Facilitating collaborative dialogue between students
- Encouraging students to ask and answer class questions using their own life experiences and prior training.



Collaborative Reform Completion Memorandum

One of the interactive adult learning activities entailed viewing a historical documentary regarding the relationship between the police and the community (Based in San Francisco). Students participated in an Adult Learning Activity regarding the historical relations between the black and brown communities. Through a facilitated discussion, the students were able to relate their professional experiences in law enforcement regarding the gradual elimination of discrimination against members of their communities. This is typically a very rich discussion with significant student participation.

Class participants also engaged in an adult learning activity called "Shoot Don't Shoot" exercise. Students are shown a picture of a person (Black or White) on the projector screen holding a cell phone or a gun and they have to respond in split seconds to what they believe they would do: shoot or don't shoot. Was it a cell phone or a gun? Class discussion followed after the completion of exercise. (See attachment #2: Principled Policing/Procedural Justice and Implicit Bias Course Outline)

To further discuss how implicit biases may impact law enforcement decision making, the class was introduced to the research and study of Dr. Lorie Fridell, a professor of Criminology at the University of South Florida and a former Director of Research at the Police Executive Research Forum (PERF) and Dr. Jennifer Eberhardt (Department of Psychology Stanford University) regarding Black Crime Association. These doctors' research looks deeper into the possibility that people in our society are more likely to identify African American faces than white faces as criminal.

Additionally, instructors for Crisis Intervention Training use the following adult learning methodology concepts:

- CIT classes start with classroom facilitated discussions on current and past high-profile incidents involving mental health issues. A review of the police videos is followed by a discussion with clinicians and instructors.
- Officers are then assigned to teams for the scenarios. All attendees are assigned roles to actively participate in the scenarios. Officers are provided incident information similar to what dispatchers provide.
- Officers respond in teams and practice working together with the emphasis on communication and the techniques that have been discussed in the lecture and police incident video reviews.
- The role players can change the outcome of the scenarios, depending on how the officers respond, and whether techniques taught are being utilized.
- At the end of the scenario, the instructors conduct a debrief of the scenario. Questions asked; what did you see, what did you do, and what was your thought process?



Collaborative Reform Completion Memorandum

- The debrief is a key component. This is where all the officers have opportunity to engage and reinforce what was learned in the lecture phase with practical opportunities to use the skills learned.
- The CIT team debriefs what exercises worked well and how can the exercises be improved.

The scenarios can have different outcomes. Officers may or may not have to use force depending on how they are confronted. Each team evaluates each scenario and apply the appropriate responses based on the training and policies. This includes an officer's determination on whether force can be or should be used. (Attachment #10: Detailed description of adult learning methodologies used in bias training classes)

4) Continuous improvement loop.

During Pre-Screen on 12/28/2020 the following feedback was given:

"Hillard Heintze asked that, under Compliance Measure 4, SFPD identify its long-term plan for an ongoing improvement loop and specifically add any external review of its training, such as SFPD's plan it had discussed in 27.2."

The Training Division consists of four separate training units that report to the Commanding Officer of the Training Division. These units are: the Professional Development Unit (PDU), Basic Academy Course, Field Training Office (FTO), and the Field Tactics/Force Options Unit (FTFO). The Professional Development Unit coordinates in service training for the department. The Basic Academy coordinates Basic recruit police academy classes and oversees the Physical Fitness/Defensive Tactics class and Emergency Vehicle Operations Course (EVOC) unit. The Field Tactics/Force Options Unit coordinates use of force and field tactics training classes.

The Training Division has an evaluation system for students to complete regarding any training class. After the conclusion of each block of instruction, each student will complete the instructor/course evaluation form. These forms are reviewed by the unit responsible for the course of instruction. An additional procedure for maintaining quality of instruction requires that the training unit responsible for the training (i.e. Field Training Office, Field Tactics/Force Options Unit, Professional Development Unit or the Basic Office) periodically monitor courses to ensure compliance with approved lesson plans and forward any relevant observations to the Professional Development Unit (PDU) for compliance. The lieutenant of the training unit responsible for the training reviews evaluations as a measure to evaluate course content and the instructor. (See Attachment #4: Academy Instructor Evaluations Unit Order).

In 2020 the COVID 19 pandemic caused a shift in training and required an increase in remote learning. Because much of in service training in the police department is now remote,



Collaborative Reform Completion Memorandum

evaluation forms are completed and received electronically. The evaluation and review process described above is still in place for all electronic evaluations. Courses can be altered and changed based on input from Training Division staff, in coordination with the instructor and POST/individual course requirements and outlines. An example of this is adding guest community speakers to speak to students of the Principled Policing and Implicit Bias Class. This was implemented due to students documenting this request on their evaluation forms and the PDU implementing it with approval of instructors.

The San Francisco Department of Human Resources (DHR) works in partnership with the San Francisco Police Department to put on the "Managing Implicit Bias Class" for all sworn and civilian members in public contact positions. The class is instructed by DHR employees and evaluations are submitted directly to them. The PDU partners with DHR and facilitates signing up department members for the class. Because it is a DHR class, the evaluations are solicited and retained by DHR, but DHR forwards the evaluation response data to the PDU for review. (See Attachment #7: DHR evaluation response data)

In 2020, the Training Division developed a new process to gauge the impact of training programs and further assess and audit quality of course and instruction. Four months after course completion, the respective unit of the Training Division responsible for the class will email a follow up training impact evaluation to students in order to audit all training classes for effectiveness of instruction and quality. This way the Training Division can determine what material was effective and meaningfully impacted students in the months after the training was completed. The evaluations are tailored to each individual class. (See Attachment #8: Follow Up Training Impact Evaluations Unit Order)

In addition, instructors of classes will also focus on reengaging with the students to reinforce training material, provide additional resources, and offer to answer any questions if needed. (See Attachment # 9: Follow up Email from DHR instructor to students of Managing Implicit Bias Class).

For all new training programs, the above evaluation and follow up impact evaluation audit and evaluation system is in place. This consists of reviewing student evaluations completed directly after the course, as well as follow up training impact evaluations received 4 months later. These systems allow the Training Division to continually audit all courses as they are offered.

The PDU Unit has an officer assigned to reviewing and implementing all bias related training and subjects. This officer reviews new training programs regarding bias provided to members of the San Francisco Police Department.

In addition, this assigned PDU officer is a liaison to DHR, which offers the Managing Implicit Bias Class outside training. This assigned PDU officer will periodically attend classes to audit for effectiveness in delivery and quality of course and instruction. When the Managing Implicit



Collaborative Reform Completion Memorandum

Bias class was instituted to a remote format due to COVID19, the assigned officer audited classes for effectiveness and documented measures to be taken for instructor effectiveness specifically for the now new virtual class.